BEFORE THE ARKANSAS DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION

March 25, 2019 10:30 A.M.

APPEARANCES

BOARD MEMBERS:

MR. JOHNNY KEY

DR. JAY BARTH Chairman
MS. CHARISSE DEAN Vice Chairman
MS. DIANE ZOOK Board Member
MR. R. BRETT WILLIAMSON Board Member
MS. OUIDA NEWTON Board Member
DR. FITZGERALD HILL Board Member

Commissioner (Non-Voting)

DR. FITZGERALD HILL Board Member
DR. SARAH MOORE Board Member
MS. KATHY McFETRIDGE Board Member

MS. RANDI HOUSE Teacher of the Year (Non-Voting)

BOARD MEMBERS (via telephone):

MS. SUSAN CHAMBERS Board Member

ADE LEGAL COUNSEL:

MS. LORI FRENO ADE General Counsel MS. MARY CLAIRE HYATT ADE Attorney

LOCATION:

Arkansas Department of Education #4 Capitol Mall - Auditorium Little Rock, AR 72201



INDEX					
					Page
New Business re: Covenant Keepers	•		•	•	3
A-1: Lee County School District		•	•		4
A-3: Covenant Keepers Charter School Subpoena	•	•	•	•	74
Adjournment		•	•	•	78
Court Reporter's Certificate	•		•		81

EXHIBITS

A-1: LEE COUNTY SCHOOL DISTRICT

EXHIBIT ONE (1)

Standards for Accreditation Recommendation for Accredited - Probation Status

PROCEEDINGS

NEW BUSINESS - COVENANT KEEPERS CHARTER

CHAIRMAN BARTH: We do -- on behalf of the Department do have one piece of new business that has emerged. And Ms. Hyatt is going to come explain, and after that I'll ask y'all to vote to place it on the agenda this morning. So I'll turn it over to Ms. Hyatt.

MS. HYATT: Thank you.

Our operating procedures in 6-17-425 of the Arkansas Code allows this board to issue subpoenas relating to Covenant Keepers -- and I can get into more detail later or now. There is a need to issue a subpoena in order to obtain some financial records; so that is the item that we would like to be placed on the agenda at the end of the agenda.

CHAIRMAN BARTH: Okay. And I'd just remind everyone that -- I think that is specific enough for the purposes of knowing what the topic is. And, of course, placing it on the agenda does not lock you into a final vote in terms of whether you -- we take action or not, but this just allows us to consider action.

So I'll entertain a motion to add this item to the action agenda as the third item today.

1	MR. WILLIAMSON: So moved.
2	CHAIRMAN BARTH: All right.
3	MS. DEAN: Second.
4	CHAIRMAN BARTH: Motion by Mr. Williamson,
5	second by Ms. Dean.
6	All in favor say "aye."
7	(UNANIMOUS CHORUS OF AYES)
8	CHAIRMAN BARTH: Opposed?
9	Okay. We will see you in a bit, Ms. Hyatt.
10	Thank you very much.
11	A-1: CONSIDERATION OF PROBATIONARY STATUS FOR LEE COUNTY
12	SCHOOL DISTRICT AND LEE HIGH SCHOOL
13	CHAIRMAN BARTH: Our first item of the day
14	though is the Consideration of Probationary Status
15	for Lee County School District and Lee High School.
16	And I'm going to turn it over to Ms. Freno to get us
17	started. I think Ms. Coffman will also be a part of
18	this opening presentation.
19	MS. FRENO: Thank you, Dr. Barth. Lori Freno,
20	Arkansas Department of Education.
21	Following an onsite review of the Lee County
22	School District, the Department determined that both
23	the District and Lee High School were in probationary
24	violation of the following Standards for
25	Accreditation:

Lee County School District: Violation of 1-C.2.1 1 2 - Each school district shall maintain accurate -- one 3 second, please. (COURT REPORTER'S NOTE: Ms. Freno repositions 4 5 microphone.) MS. FRENO: Each school district shall maintain 6 7 accurate student records including graduation 8 requirements. Specifically, the District did not maintain accurate, up-to-date transcripts, and 9 10 parents/students were not notified of 11 issues/significant changes such as students waiving 12 Smart Core. 13 Second --Ms. Freno, just -- why don't we 14 CHAIRMAN BARTH: 15 wait till we get this technical challenge --16 MS. FRENO: I think I made the technical 17 malfunction happen. It just sounded like it was 18 screeching at y'all and I didn't want to be 19 screeching at y'all. 20 Second, Lee High School was found to be in 21 probationary violation of 1-C.2.2 - For graduation, 22 students must have acquired a minimum of twenty-two 23 (22) units of credit as determined by the State Board 24 of Education. Specifically, students expecting to 25 graduate did not have appropriate guidance to

schedule a minimum of twenty-two (22) units of 1 2 approved credit, and student transcripts did not reflect the appropriate courses aligned with Smart 3 4 Core or Core. 5 The District [sic] notified the Lee County School District of these violates -- of these 6 7 findings on March 6, 2019. The District then appealed these findings and the State Board will hear 8 9 this appeal during its board meeting today as the first step that it should take. If the State Board 10 11 denies the appeal, it must next vote -- so that's 12 number one, the appeal. 13 Number two, if it denies the appeal, in that 14 case it would next determine whether to place the 15 High School, the School District, or both, on probationary status for standards violations. 16 17 State Board places either the District or the High 18 School (or both) in probationary status, the Board may take one or more of the actions set forth in 19 Section 6-15-207 of the Arkansas Code. 20 So at this point, unless the State Board has --21 22 unless anyone has any questions, I would like to read 23 the procedures for the appeal. 24 [MOMENT OF SILENCE] 25 MS. FRENO: All persons wishing to testify

1	before the State Board shall first be placed under
2	oath by the Chairperson of the State Board. The
3	Department shall have the Department goes first,
4	and the Department shall have up to 20 minutes to
5	present its case to the State Board. The Chair of
6	the State Board may also allow additional time, if
7	necessary. The appealing public school district
8	shall have up to 20 minutes to present its case to
9	the State Board. The Chair, again, may allow
10	additional time, if necessary. And the Board may
11	pose questions to any party at any time during the
12	hearing.
13	CHAIRMAN BARTH: All right. And so at the end
14	of this appeal process the proper motion will be to
15	either uphold the appeal or deny the appeal.
16	Correct?
17	MS. FRENO: Yes, Dr. Barth, that's correct.
18	CHAIRMAN BARTH: All right.
19	MS. ZOOK: And will the Department have a
20	recommendation?
21	MS. FRENO: Yes, the Department will.
22	COMMISSIONER KEY: Yes.
23	CHAIRMAN BARTH: Okay. Any other questions
24	about the process?
25	All right. So we are now ready to go first

1 off, why don't we get everybody -- why don't we go 2 ahead and swear anyone from the District who plans to 3 offer testimony. So if everybody -- anybody from the District who plans to offer testimony would go ahead 5 and stand and raise your right hand. Stand and -- and we can swear additional 6 7 people if it becomes clear that other people need to 8 offer testimony. But for those who plan to testify -- do you swear or affirm that the testimony you're 10 about to give shall be the truth, the whole truth, 11 and nothing but the truth? 12 (ALL WITNESSES WHO STOOD TO BE SWORN ANSWERED AFFIRMATIVELY) 13 Thank you very much. CHAIRMAN BARTH: Great. 14 All right. I'll now turn it over to Ms. Coffman 15 for 20 minutes from the Department. 16 MS. COFFMAN: Deborah Coffman, Arkansas 17 Department of Ed. 18 First of all, I'd like to say that if you've not 19 had a chance to visit Lee County School District you 20 are going to meet some of the most remarkable 21 They are so courteous, they are students around. 22 kind, they are engaging. They're just what you would 23 expect of Arkansas students. They're just amazing. 24 I would also like to say that the staff that we 25 encountered were just equally lovely and

accommodating to us.

So today we bring this to you with a heavy
heart, but we do believe that this school district is
in violation of two probationary items from our
Standards for Accreditation. Now the reason I bring
this to you today is because of the timeline that
we're under.

We started on February 5th with an onsite monitoring and identified an issue with transcripts. This is egregious and needs to be resolved immediately. The last day for seniors, my understanding, is May 10th, so days are ticking by and we have a lot of work to do. Without immediate intervention, 35 of the 56 seniors will either not graduate on time or they will graduate with an incomplete or incorrect transcript. Because of the lack of adult oversight study transcripts contained errors, course schedules do not include the required 22 credits, students were not on track to graduate with Smart Core, and the appropriate documentation for a waiver of Smart Core had not been put into place at that time, which means that parents and students had not been consulted with -- and waiting till the last 60 days before graduation is late to be having those conversations with parents.

25

1

2

were not enrolled in credit recovery as needed, and evidence that they were being supported for credit recovery was not obvious to us.

So since that meeting there was little urgency. We began to go back to insure that students' were -needs were being met. We went back February 26th -and as you go through here, you'll see our timeline starting on page 3. On February 26th Dr. Kristi McIntosh, our Standards and Systems Support Specialist, Ms. Gina Windle, our Chief of Staff, and I sat with the superintendent, Ms. Johnson, with the high school principal, Mr. Simpson, and with the counselor, Mr. Taylor -- and all of them are here today. We sat with them; we went through every senior transcript and identified what the issues were that we were seeing in Triand and talked with them about what's going on -- got to get these kids in credit recovery, we're missing these classes, they need to be enrolled in an accelerated program to get their required 22. We went through every one of those. We asked at that time, "What can we do to support you?" And the counselor said, "Would you come one day a week and just stay with us, stay -keep us on track?" We said, "Absolutely, we would -we will be there to help you."

25

1

The next day we were notified that the counselor was suspended, and had been suspended as of February 21st -- and that's certainly a personnel issue between the District and the counselor; however, the counselor was there, so we felt that that was a false pretense. We noticed then, in reflection, that the counselor was not engaged in -- on the computer in eSchool, in Triand, looking at the transcripts; they were taking notes, which was fine. But finding out next day that he was suspended made it make more sense. We were then notified that the counselor was

We visited again. Dr. McIntosh and I went back on March 5th and we once again visited with Mr. Taylor, the counselor, and we went through every one of the transcripts again. At that time he had access to some things, but not all things that a counselor needs to have access to -- eSchool, Triand, APEX, all of the tools a counselor uses. At that time we did not feel that we were getting -- that the sense of urgency to get these students enrolled in their courses was there. They had not been enrolled. We were -- he -- Mr. Taylor was enrolling some as we were sitting with him but there were many that had not been enrolled, and certainly students had not

reinstated and returned to work on February 28th.

been contacted and their parents had not been contacted at that time.

At that time, that afternoon I shared with the superintendent that we would recommend probation for them, that this was an issue that had to be resolved immediately.

We then had another -- we sent those appropriate letters that you have on your agenda, and then Dr. McIntosh and Kristy Harrell from our Standards and Systems Support once again visited. This time they visited with the high school principal and the high school counselor substitute, Ms. McCrae, and again reviewed the student transcripts. We did receive an appeal letter, and then with that appeal letter on your agenda you'll see additional documentation. In that additional documentation is information about credit recovery classes, the kids that were enrolled.

We went through and aligned our notes with those notes in the appeal, and we believe that in the graduating class of 2019 that we still have 12 seniors that need credit recovery courses that have not been enrolled in those courses. We know that based on that documentation 12 other seniors are enrolled in 30 credit recovery courses, meaning 30 credits worth of courses on top of their senior class

24

25

Some students have two, four, six, eight schedule. credit recovery classes to try to complete before graduation on top of their daily schedule. seniors have not had access to the required 22 credits; they still need to be enrolled into an accelerated class to try to get that done. have 10 additional transcripts that still need verification. And so we've had conversations and they say, "Yes, yes, we have this," but we haven't seen evidence that the students have completed the courses, and that's what we're looking for -- hard evidence that, yes, they completed a credit recovery or, yes, they took the class somewhere else or maybe they're taking it as a concurrent credit at a university, where is the credit coming from. We need to see the documentation so that we can feel confident that those students are ready to graduate.

These kids need our immediate attention -immediate. We have approximately 46 calendar days to
help them not only complete their senior class
schedule but all of these additional courses that
they need to graduate on time.

Is this a systemic issue? We believe it is. When I pulled up the transcripts -- the Triand transcripts for grade 11, I can see clearly 20

students have transcript errors that are just obvious. They have 200 credit hours. So there are data entry errors in those transcripts which have to be cleaned up so that you can actually see what the student really has and what they really need. So right now, to our best estimate 31 of the 44 juniors have completed the on-time credits necessary to graduate if they pass all the classes they're in right now. So they're running about 70%.

In the 10th grade you can see 13 obvious errors. Once again, there's been data entry errors into the transcripts that have yet to be cleaned up that we have noted from the very beginning of our on-site visits.

Grade 9 has two students with transcript errors.

And as you'll see, the numbers that I'm giving you are our best estimates -- and until you have the transcripts cleaned up, you don't really know if the kids are on track to graduate. That's just by taking a look in Triand. If you've ever been in there, it's green and pink and it gives you an indicator whether or not the kids are on track.

Now just for your purposes I want you to note that this does not reflect their cohort data. This is just actual kids in those classes this year. This

is not tracking back all the way to their cohort data. So that'll be another conversation at another time.

I did go back and look at last year's graduating class of 2018, and it's very clear -- the records are clear that 36 of our seniors graduated with the Smart Core; 13 had 22-plus credits but were not reported as Smart Core in Triand, which means they may have graduated on a waiver but that was not clearly noted; 9 students were flagged for not having appropriate credits -- but when I dug into each one of those I can see that one student graduated with 21.5 credits as reported in Triand. Now once we get in there and we get to working closely with the counselor we may find that there's additional documentation that was just never entered. So I don't want you to walk away thinking that they were graduating kids with less We don't know because of the numerous errors that we're finding or incomplete documentation. There may be better documentation that we just don't see in the system; so in the files, somewhere on paper there may be information that can report this. Another student graduated but failed English 11, second semester -- can't find any place where the student took that second semester. Six other kids

25

1 may have graduated on IEPs; it was not accurately 2 documented into the transcript -- and those students 3 failed numerous courses and I can't see anywhere in there where there was documentation that they took 5 credit recovery or took another class. 6 So I can't say certain, but I can say certainly 7 the transcripts are not accurate and that is a violation of Standards for Accreditation. And not 8 9 giving kids the opportunity for a quality education is a violation of Standards for Accreditation. 10 11 Thank you. 12 CHAIRMAN BARTH: Thank you. Any questions before Ms. Coffman sits down? 13 14 Obviously there'll be later opportunities as well, 15 but --16 Ms. Zook. 17 MS. ZOOK: Is anyone hearing a feedback on the 18 microphones? Dan, is there something that --19 I'm steadily -- I'm steadily trying to 20 adjust them. I think part of it is coming off our 21 conference call mic. 22 MS. ZOOK: Okay. Okay. Thank you. 23 CHAIRMAN BARTH: Okay. 24 I'm working on it. DAN: 25 CHAIRMAN BARTH: All right. Thank you.

Okay. All right. Then next up, the District.

And y'all can arrange your presentation however you'd like, but you do have up to 20 minutes.

Great. And as everybody comes up, if you'll just identify yourself for the record.

Good morning.

SUPT. JOHNSON: Good morning. My name is
Elizabeth Johnson and I'm presently superintendent of
Lee County School District.

We are actually appealing this because of exactly some of the things that she said.

I became interim superintendent there on March 1, 2018. So when I came in there were things already in process -- one had to do with the individuals being RIF'd. So we dealt with that, and after which the same personnel were there and they were in charge of everything until July -- July 1. July 1 a new game came in, myself and the persons we hired. We are now getting a-hold on what was going on. Let me tell you about the staff that's there now. The lady here, the gentleman back there, and myself have over 100 years of active service in education. We would never, ever violate any standards knowingly. For one thing, I can know that I -- you should know that I've worked with every Commissioner since Tommy Venters.

So we know what should be done and how it should be

Now the reason we appeal this, number one, because they came in with the guise of "we're going to help you." So that's what we were expecting. Came in February 5th, first time we ever saw them. We called a couple of ladies here about the errors thev said we had. Those errors had to do with teacher certification and licensure, as well as background checks. That was all. Those were the How do we know this? Because things we were told. online you can see standards. Not until November 15th was it open. So once it was open and we got those standards listed -- we were told that these standards would be new and it would be done a different way. So, of course, we waited for that. When we printed those standards out to see were we meeting those standards we could not see them. after November 15th came Thanksgiving. Right after Thanksgiving came Christmas, which was another two to three weeks. So as I said, again, we never saw them till February 5th.

We did not understand from the very first visit that anything was wrong. Three people came in; one talked to the federal programs and the other person

24

25

talked to the counselor from the high school. Now we did know there are some problems, so I'm not going to tell you there were not problems. But we know our children too and we know what we can do with our children, and they know us. Now in Lee County, we've done everything we can to make certain those children graduate, and each year they have done so.

Number two that we appeal on is we should've had March 5th was the first time we more notice on this. heard from them about big problems -- very first We got a letter on March 5th. And I believe time. you know calendars -- you can see how fast that is for us to answer this. Well, we have pretty much answered everything that you -- I mean, we've given two documents about what was wrong with standards in Lee County. We have those documents for you and I believe you'll be able to access them. Everything that they said was wrong we found all of the information for them, because we have it. Again, this has to do with students and graduation and we will make certain that they are -- now we've counted down how many students and transcripts they looked We went back over the same -- some of the same stuff later on that we -- after we give this. those students were special ed. students. They don't

25

1

23

24

25

come out the right color on that grid. So you have to go back and find that out. We went into Triand and we found out that some of the things just had not been put in -- many of those things had not been put So we put them in there. And so I don't think there's nearly the students -- we came up with about 10 or so, but they are enrolled in classes right now that will make certain -- we've got to look at the report and that's it now to make certain they're passing those classes and they will graduate, because they're enrolled in there. Credit recovery -- we do that every semester, all semester. We have afterschool and we have APEX and we have other programs to make certain they're passing those classes. understanding now, there's no seat time, so they go to other schools and get out in a couple of weeks or whatever, out of a course. It's not like it used to be; you had to sit there for all those hours, you You can go online and take those courses. And even if -- years ago, you could take a course that was correspondence and you still could pass and graduate, I know; we did it many times.

So the urgency of this we feel might be something less than probationary status because we're a new group. If we were the same people, I might say

22

23

24

25

"yes, okay." But we are a new group who knew that there were problems in Lee County, and we came back to solve those problems because -- we could've been on a beach where we were, but we came back in to help the school district. This was a total surprise. one day somebody gives you all of this information that we don't have. I had never heard of this thing she said until now; this is my first time seeing this I can't address things that you haven't document. given me, but I can fix things when I know -- and I have done so. I've been an administrator in a school district for over 20-some years. Never once has Standards ever come to a building where I was an administrator and just said that we have a problem. We adhere to our problems now, but we don't think the probationary status is correct for Lee County. want to be afforded time to take care of our They're our children. We want them to have the best education possible, and so we're going to do that -- and we are doing that.

Another thing is that we thought actually we were going to get a little help. It didn't work out that way because we were put on a high-level status. There's a lower level status for this kind of thing. We did have to work hard to get those things because

we didn't have access to some of that coming in new.

So I'm not appealing on that. I'm appealing on that

we didn't have time.

Number two: still those things cannot be put on the status of probationary until they don't happen.

We have nine weeks left for it to happen and I assure you it will happen.

I can tell you other things that we have been doing. We make certain that the children are on those programs they're to be on. We have to -- of course, you have to get in a counselor's office, because we were not counselors. But we've been in that system now, where it was not enough training about that as an administrator, I can tell you that. But one thing you have to go to eSchool, to Triand, to something else before you can find all of this information. There are two people in charge of Lee County at this moment: Ms. Hayden and myself -- two Staff development, -- and we work all of this. curriculum, everything in the district we work it together, which is kind of a large plan because of the people not there in positions.

But I'm going to appeal to you today that we have looked at every -- every one of those standards. We've gone back to make certain that we're in

24

25

compliance. This one we have to -- of course, we're still working on this one. I'm not going to tell you we're not. We're working on this to make certain we're in compliance and that children will graduate. We don't want to keep them anyway. We want them to go on, just like their parents want them to go on. But as I said, the Google doc is there. We have plenty of those we've sent to Ms. Coffman, as well as Ms. Webb, and you can see them I'm sure if they give you access to it. You can see every standard that we had to meet -- every statute -- and we did that.

We have a plan in place coming up that this won't happen again. The plan is -- we've already sent out letters to those parents and those students. We have documentation that we've done so. The students have signed to say which core they would prefer to take. And you know when they've signed early on in 6th grade and 7th grade they say Smart Core -- but then later they do not want to take the challenge of that. So sometimes they go to the next core or they go technical and career. So that is probably what an issue was. But, of course, as I said, we've taken care of that one.

The next thing is afterschool, summer school -- all of those areas have been taken care of. Children

25

who will come get credit recovery -- personalized, not necessarily on the computer. We also have a plan then for the summer and we do notify all parents if they're failing. We call them. We do what we can to get students in summer school. That is one way of keeping them on task and not letting them fall behind. There are some things -- is that teachers have allowed some of these students also -- according to things they want you to -- they would allow them to do projects in order to get a grade. Well, that grade sometimes is not coming in on time. we're getting those grades in right now of those students who lack a grade. Those teachers have sent me emails and told me that those children are getting -- they have -- they've passed them on those particular projects that they had to finish.

Any other issue that has to do with students we've approached it. We have a plan in the document that you have access to -- I think you do anyway.

If not, would you ladies give them access to those documents?

There are plenty of them. We have a box full of those documents right over there, signed by parents, signed letters, Certified letters. We have approached them the best way we can. And, of course,

some of these students are 18; they have to sign for themselves, and they let you know, "I sign for me."

So we say, "Okay." We've done that. We let them know that's also in policy. How can you become a sophomore? We have so many credits you must reach; otherwise, you're still a freshman. We do the same thing as an 11th grader, as well as a senior.

So we are documenting and doing the things we should be doing. And that's an excuse for a year -but I'm telling you, I haven't been back there for one -- one year this month. And, again, it was not given to us the things that she told you a few That documentation is brand-new to me. minutes ago. All they told us was about -- they said 22 students, I believe, at first -- well, the first I heard from somebody. I wasn't in on all of them because I couldn't be. And that's when we decided to tackle it The counselor knew. And as I've said right now, and as she said, the counselor is no longer the one in charge of that and no longer there. We have a trained staff, being trained more, to make certain we can follow what's going on. That person's name is Ms. Jarrett. She's there right now working with a different counselor to establish what can happen for these students.

25

Again, I thank you for listening to me. And Ms. Hayden has more information, a little bit more. can give you the documents and where to find them on your computer. But those are things that I think we can take care of within this nine weeks -- [clearing throat] -- excuse me -- nine weeks -- I'm getting dry mouth. But I believe we will take care of it. certainly want to see those students get out of school and move on. Thank you. Thank you, Ms. Johnson. CHAIRMAN BARTH:

All right.

MS. HAYDEN: Good morning. My name is Mary I am the Federal Programs Coordinator/ District Coordinator for Lee County School District.

I do not have anything else really to offer in addition to what Superintendent Johnson says except for I have sent the documents to Ms. Coffman, Dr. McIntosh, and Ms. Tracy Webb. So I do not have all of your email addresses, but they can share the documents that we've provided to them. include the information for the two standard violations that you-all are looking at today, as well as other violations that we -- well, they're not all violations, but they were brought to our attention as things that are being monitored. So we wanted to

1

1	address all of them so you will have that
2	information, and that can be shared by Ms. Coffman,
3	Dr. McIntosh, and Ms. Webb. Thank you.
4	CHAIRMAN BARTH: Great. Thank you.
5	Are there any questions on either of anybody
6	from the District?
7	MS. ZOOK: From Lee?
8	CHAIRMAN BARTH: Uh-huh.
9	MS. ZOOK: I was wondering if you gave interim
10	tests so you would know how well your students are
11	progressing and when they're not there, in fact,
12	mastering these courses?
13	MS. HAYDEN: The interim test that we are giving
14	this year comes from iReady. We're using that
15	particular program this year. So we've given that
16	three times a year we've given it twice and we
17	have it coming up as well as the STAR for K-2.
18	And we also use Classworks. They have a benchmark
19	part there that we use to test our students.
20	MS. ZOOK: Okay. And is it in literacy, math
21	and science or what the whole
22	MS. HAYDEN: The test will address literacy and
23	math.
24	MS. ZOOK: Okay.
25	MS. HAYDEN: So we have the reading and the

1	math. We do not have the science, but we do have
2	literacy and math addressed.
3	MS. ZOOK: And are the teachers provided the
4	results of those tests so they'll know how to do an
5	RTI or refer them or check for markers of dyslexia or
6	refer to special ed.?
7	MS. HAYDEN: They do have access to take a look
8	at the data. And we've also brought in the
9	consultants from those particular companies to come
10	in and train those teachers on how to look at the
11	data.
12	MS. ZOOK: Uh-huh. And is the information
13	shared with the parents?
14	MS. HAYDEN: The information from the
15	assessments for the iReady and the STAR have been
16	shared with parents.
17	MS. ZOOK: Okay. And for the Superintendent,
18	it's my understanding that we do in fact have
19	standards that were updated from '83. But as far as
20	I know, the standard for 22 credits and Smart Core
21	and what's needed for graduation has not changed. Is
22	that your understanding?
23	SUPT. JOHNSON: Yes, ma'am.
24	MS. ZOOK: Okay. Thank you. That's all.
25	SUPT. JOHNSON: I'd like to add, that's in our

1	policy and it's in our handbook.
2	CHAIRMAN BARTH: Dr. Moore.
3	DR. MOORE: Yes, I do have a couple of
4	questions.
5	So the credit recovery courses that students are
6	now being enrolled in, are those online courses?
7	MS. HAYDEN: They are APEX.
8	DR. MOORE: Okay. And so
9	MS. HAYDEN: And some of them are working with
10	teachers.
11	DR. MOORE: Okay.
12	MS. HAYDEN: But mostly it's APEX.
13	DR. MOORE: And what would are a majority of
14	courses at the high school level taught through
15	online courses or are they in-person teachers?
16	MS. HAYDEN: The majority of the courses or the
17	majority of the credit recovery courses?
18	DR. MOORE: Regular courses.
19	MS. HAYDEN: The majority of the regular courses
20	are taught by teachers on campus.
21	DR. MOORE: Okay. As far as your high
22	school counselor goes, there is someone employed as a
23	high school counselor right now?
24	MS. HAYDEN: We do have a substitute counselor
25	in place.

1	DR. MOORE: Okay. Do y'all have any
2	supplemental services for mental health and college
3	and career readiness?
4	MS. HAYDEN: There are supplemental services.
5	We do work with several of the external providers;
6	they come in and work with our students as well. And
7	then we do have our counselor there. Mrs. Johnson
8	may be able to give you more information about that,
9	but we do provide those kind of services as well
10	as career readiness, that comes through the
11	counselor's office.
12	DR. MOORE: Okay.
13	CHAIRMAN BARTH: Ms. Zook.
14	MS. ZOOK: Yes. Did we swear in the high school
15	principal?
16	MS. HAYDEN: Yes.
17	CHAIRMAN BARTH: Yes.
18	MS. ZOOK: Okay. I have a couple or three
19	questions for that person.
20	MR. SIMPSON: My name is Earnest Simpson,
21	Junior. I'm the Principal at Lee Senior High School,
22	in Marianna, Arkansas.
23	CHAIRMAN BARTH: Thanks, Mr. Simpson.
24	MS. ZOOK: Thank you. I know that there are
25	requirements of how much time a counselor is supposed

1	to spend with students in actual counseling versus
2	administrative work. So as Principal it's my
3	assumption that you were completely aware of all of
4	these issues that have been brought to us today?
5	MR. SIMPSON: I would say yes. Yes, I was
6	MS. ZOOK: Okay.
7	MR. SIMPSON: basically aware of it. Yes.
8	MS. ZOOK: And how long have you been Principal
9	there?
10	MR. SIMPSON: Since July 1
11	MS. ZOOK: Okay. And how long
12	MR. SIMPSON: 2018.
13	MS. ZOOK: have you been a high school
14	principal?
15	MR. SIMPSON: Beg your pardon?
16	MS. ZOOK: How long have you been a high school
17	principal?
18	MR. SIMPSON: Since July 1, 2018.
19	MS. ZOOK: Oh. This is your first time?
20	MR. SIMPSON: I was a middle school principal
21	prior to that. Well, I've been retired for 11 years,
22	and I was a middle school principal when I retired.
23	MS. ZOOK: Okay. So this is on-the-job
24	training?
25	MR. SIMPSON: Basically.

1 MS. ZOOK: Okay. Thank you. That's all. 2 CHAIRMAN BARTH: Okay. Questions, Ms. Newton? 3 MS. NEWTON: I'm not sure who can best answer 4 this. But you said most of them in credit recovery 5 were in APEX, but some of them had teacher-led credit 6 recovery. How are you making sure that they get what 7 they need to complete a course? 8 MR. SIMPSON: Well, we've gone to those -- some 9 of those teachers that -- where some of the children 10 are doing credit recovery and we've talked to them 11 about giving them the credit that they need and the 12 -- doing the work that they need to get the recovery 13 of the classes. 14 I guess my question is how do the MS. NEWTON: 15 teachers make sure that those students have mastered 16 the course to be able to give them the credit? 17 MR. SIMPSON: Give them tests. Yeah. 18 Okay. According to what you're MS. NEWTON: 19 looking at, how many students do you think right now 20 are not on track to graduate? 21 MR. SIMPSON: From what we -- the last that I 22 looked at it, Friday before we got out for spring 23 break, I saw maybe three that was not on track. All 24 the others do what has been -- been told them. 25 They've been called in. I have the documentation

1	showing where they've been called in and told that
2	they need to do this or that, and if they do that
3	then we've got about two that probably won't make
4	it two or three.
5	MS. NEWTON: Let's talk about the ones, first,
6	that you've talked to that are seemingly going to do
7	the work. Are most of them on-board with doing the
8	work? Are they having good attitudes about getting
9	in there and doing the work?
10	MR. SIMPSON: All of them have good attitudes
11	about it and are saying definitely they would
12	complete it.
13	MS. NEWTON: Okay.
14	MR. SIMPSON: Now because
15	MS. NEWTON: What's being done for the two or
16	three that you think are not going to be on track to
17	graduate? What are you doing for them?
18	MR. SIMPSON: Well, it's not a whole lot we can
19	do for them, because one of them is not attending.
20	We hadn't been able to reach him by phone. He's been
21	out a couple of weeks. And I think he's looking at
22	maybe 11 credits to this date.
23	MS. NEWTON: So you think you probably will have
24	two or three that will not graduate?
25	MR. SIMPSON: Right.

1	MS. NEWTON: Okay. Thank you.
2	CHAIRMAN BARTH: Anyone else on this side?
3	I actually have a question for Ms. Coffman, if
4	you and I know you weren't in this role before.
5	But the District's previous Standards for
6	Accreditation issues in 2013 and '14, what were
7	what was the general nature of those? Do you have
8	any memory?
9	MS. COFFMAN: I don't.
10	CHAIRMAN BARTH: Okay. But they
11	MS. COFFMAN: Memory, you know I don't have
12	that.
13	CHAIRMAN BARTH: I don't believe they weren't
14	graduation; they were more they were other types
15	of do you I just can't remember what they were.
16	MS. COFFMAN: (Shaking head from side to side.)
17	CHAIRMAN BARTH: Okay.
18	MS. COFFMAN: I don't know.
19	CHAIRMAN BARTH: I was just trying to capture
20	the persistence of this particular issue versus some
21	other issues.
22	MS. COFFMAN: So Ms. Knowles is not here today;
23	Rodney Ford is. But we did reach out to Ms. Knowles
24	in the Guidance Counseling office to see if she was
25	aware of any previous issues, and she said she

1	sent some documentation of previous visits where
2	transcript errors had been an issue that they
3	counseled with the school.
4	CHAIRMAN BARTH: Okay. Thank you very much.
5	DR. MOORE: Actually, I have another one.
6	CHAIRMAN BARTH: Dr. Moore.
7	DR. MOORE: I have another Ms. Coffman, I
8	have another question for you. What has the
9	District been placed under a level for ESSA?
10	MS. COFFMAN: No. Under state accountability?
11	DR. MOORE: Yes.
12	MS. COFFMAN: So for under ESSA there's two
13	different things. So under ESSA they have been
14	offered a 10.03 grant I believe is correct my
15	person back here
16	MS. HAYDEN: (Nodding head up and down.)
17	MS. COFFMAN: Yes. So there is an implied level
18	of support, Level 2 support, that's been with them.
19	Actually, my intention in going in with them was to
20	offer a level of support to them but when we did
21	not see immediate action, we felt that our level of
22	support was not going to be met in the timeline that
23	these students needed.
24	DR. MOORE: Okay. And then looking at their
25	report cards, both there's two schools in the

1 District and both received F's --2 MS. COFFMAN: That's correct. 3 DR. MOORE: -- last year with very low 4 performance? That's correct. We did offer 5 MS. COFFMAN: immediate support. I mean, Dr. McIntosh has been 6 going every week. But we've been there -- she's been there three times now and we've done the same thing 9 each time; so we're not making progress -- and these 10 students need progress. 11 DR. MOORE: And is -- has Dr. Hernandez and his 12 team come into the District? 13 MS. COFFMAN: Sheila Whitlow is here and she has 14 been providing support. 15 DR. MOORE: Okay. Thank you. 16 CHAIRMAN BARTH: Ms. Zook, would you like to --17 MS. ZOOK: Yes. Maybe -- I don't know if it's a 18 question or a statement. My concern for students, 19 who the vast majority of them cannot read on level, 20 is that if they are left to work on a computer for 21 credit recovery, I'm not -- that -- the teacher in me 22 and the parent in me, that doesn't work. So how can 23 you feel comfortable that credit recovery can in fact 24 happen if a student who is significantly below level 25 in reading and math can in fact complete the task

1 without help from an adult? 2 They're never left alone. SUPT. JOHNSON: 3 There's always someone there with them in whichever room they're in. They're never left alone. But I 5 can tell you -- I can assure you that we get the 6 printout on what they're doing and you'd be surprised; they're passing. They are passing with -usually there's an instructor in that room. They 9 don't go home with a computer; they use the computer 10 there in the presence of other adults. And then when 11 they get -- when the printouts -- the last printouts 12 I got of them, they were passing. 13 MS. ZOOK: And are those adults certified to 14 teach --15 SUPT. JOHNSON: Yes. 16 MS. ZOOK: -- those areas? 17 SUPT. JOHNSON: Well, maybe not in that area, 18 but they're certified teachers. Because they could 19 be in, let's say, the science room, but he's 20 monitoring those students if they're doing a 21 recovery. 22 MS. ZOOK: Right. But if it's a geometry 23 problem or English IV problem, do -- I mean, I know 24 we -- our teachers are capable and bright, but there 25 are some things that we would have to study ourselves

in order to be helpful to a student.

SUPT. JOHNSON: As I said, I kind of felt like you feel, but it has not been as big a problem as I thought -- because one area is geometry and they passed. So I was kind of like okay. These children are acclimating to watching TV, to cell phones; they are tech ready, so they can do it. And plus usually they can get those tutorials too to help them finish things, so they know how to do that; so they do that.

MS. ZOOK: Okay. Are these students planning on industry certification, two-year college? Do you know what their after-high school plan is and whether they are going to be prepared to actually accomplish those things?

SUPT. JOHNSON: I'll say most of them go career. That's what they think they should do. We probably have more children who do that -- go into a career field. Whether they go into college -- although many of them have the college-bound, where they can go to college if they want to -- we do encourage them to go to college. We have -- do a credit offering in our school district, and right now we have -- also with the career tech they go to UACC and they're receiving that line as well as the school line. And so pretty much I think they know they can choose one way or the

other. We've been kind of successful, I assume, with our children getting jobs and being able to accomplish that for themselves when they're out of Lee High School.

MS. ZOOK: Okay. When these students were -the high school students were screened for markers of
dyslexia did you -- how many did you find had the
markers and what kind of intervention did you give
them?

SUPT. JOHNSON: We just looked at that, because we've been audited on every situation. And what we found was that in high school -- I believe she had three students that they identified as dyslexic, and one is getting that help; the other two actually went to special ed. So what happens here -- I'm saying that 11th and 12th grade -- what happens here is sometimes that they're too low to be classified as dyslexic, which is the word now, and so then they put them in special ed. -- which is another route for African Americans to go to special ed. Bless our hearts. And so we give them -- we have three -three people there that do that job in Lee County, called dyslexic, and so I think they're being taken care of.

MS. ZOOK: Uh-huh.

1

1	
	SUPT. JOHNSON: We know one anyway
2	MS. ZOOK: Yeah. I would
3	SUPT. JOHNSON: at the high school that is.
4	MS. ZOOK: caution you
5	SUPT. JOHNSON: But there's two or three of them
6	
7	MS. ZOOK: Yeah. I would caution you if those
8	three people are advising you that there is a level
9	of too low or too high or a racial component to
10	dyslexia, then I think you need to ask for those
11	people to get training because those in fact are not
12	accurate information.
13	SUPT. JOHNSON: Well, I think the ones that
14	receive that and according to my my knowing and
15	hearing about dyslexic, something else wrong you
16	know, the person that had that did get that. But the
17	other children probably need some kind of extra help;
18	so that's why they're put in special education. We
19	do give them they're from the I believe it's
LI LI	the Boulder they have two programs that they use
20	
20 21	for dyslexic students and they are being taught with
	for dyslexic students and they are being taught with that.
21	
21 22	that.

1 MS. COFFMAN: I have follow-up to the previous 2 question. 3 CHAIRMAN BARTH: Great. Thanks. In '13-14, they were placed on 4 MS. COFFMAN: 5 probationary status second-year. And that year it 6 was Lee High School was put on probationary status 7 and the District was cited for late cycle 8 submissions. They were put on probationary status 9 for not having the appropriate job codes applied to 10 the right people. 11 And then also March 17, 2017, the A-D -- well, 12 actually, April 13, 2017, at the regular Board 13 meeting there was Standards for Accreditation 14 conversation with the State Board. And both the 15 District and Lee High School were put into violation 16 of Standards for Accreditation for failure to employ 17 a counselor to meet the 1-to-450 student ratio. 18 Lee High School, failure to offer and teach the 38 19 required courses. 20 CHAIRMAN BARTH: Okay. Thank you. 21 MS. CHAMBERS: Dr. Barth, I have a question. 22 CHAIRMAN BARTH: Yes, Ms. Chambers, go ahead. 23 MS. CHAMBERS: If we were to deny the appeal, 24 could Ms. Coffman speak to then what would be I guess I'm looking for the contrast. 25 different?

But what additional resources would be brought to bear to address the urgency that we're hearing about relative to this particular graduating class? That's one question.

Second question has to do with the arriving juniors and sophomores and what additional could be/would be done for them to insure that we aren't facing a similar issue for them their senior year?

CHAIRMAN BARTH: Great. Thank you.

Ms. Coffman, do you want to --

So if the appeal is denied and you MS. COFFMAN: do find them in probationary status, then we would ask that you give us permission to go in immediately with a team and begin working not only on cleaning up these transcripts but supporting students, making sure that they know what they need to accomplish, and to see if they can; if they can't, make sure that we're already getting them scheduled into summer courses, making contact with the parents as necessary to keep them informed. But we need to have some trained counselors on-site immediately. We believe there may also be some IEPs that need to be monitored to insure that those students are actually graduating with the appropriate coursework. So that needs to be done immediately -- because if these students have to

1 complete all of this credit recovery, that's a lot of 2 work in a short amount of time. 3 CHAIRMAN BARTH: And I think the second part of 4 the question related to -- that's obviously very much 5 focused on this year's graduating --MS. COFFMAN: 6 Yes. 7 CHAIRMAN BARTH: -- students. So I think Ms. 8 Chambers was also asking about what would be going on 9 for rising sophomores and juniors. 10 MS. COFFMAN: So the second thing is then we've 11 got to have people in there making sure the 12 transcripts for the future classes -- graduating 13 classes, that we -- that those transcripts are all 14 corrected. As I told you, we identified those 15 errors, but we need to go in and make sure that those 16 classes -- those courses are accurately reported in 17 That's the first thing is to make those transcripts. 18 sure that's happening. And we've got to get master 19 schedules built that don't allow kids to miss the 20 required 22 courses. Those are just the most obvious 21 up-front. 22 CHAIRMAN BARTH: And when does schedule-building 23 typically happen? 24 MS. COFFMAN: Now. 25 CHAIRMAN BARTH: Yeah.

1 MS. COFFMAN: Or already finished in some cases 2 or all the way into the summer in some schools. 3 it's immediate. 4 CHAIRMAN BARTH: It's the heart of the season. 5 MS. COFFMAN: Yes. Ms. Chambers, did that 6 CHAIRMAN BARTH: Okay. 7 answer your questions? 8 It did. Thank you. MS. CHAMBERS: 9 CHAIRMAN BARTH: Okay. Ms. Newton. 10 Ms. Coffman, go back to what you MS. NEWTON: 11 said just a minute ago, because you talk fast and I 12 guess I didn't catch it. April 2017 -- again, what 13 happened then? 14 MS. COFFMAN: Oh, here it is. Because that wasn't on our timeline 15 MS. NEWTON: 16 is the reason I'm asking. 17 MS. COFFMAN: No, it wasn't. It was -- the question was had they had previous accreditation 18 19 issues -- yes. And if you notice back on your timeline, on June 12th the State Board voted to 20 21 classify Lee County High School as second-year 22 probationary status for Standards for Accreditation. And so they had been notified as of March 17, 2017 23 24 that there had been accreditation issues with the 25 employment of a counselor to meet the ratio and

1	failure to offer and teach the 38 required courses.
2	MS. NEWTON: So was that why they were already
3	on second-year or were they still on second-year
4	or I mean
5	MS. COFFMAN: That's what happened in that year.
6	MS. NEWTON: So were they on any kind of
7	MS. COFFMAN: They were on probationary from the
8	year before as well.
9	MS. NEWTON: So they were still on probation and
10	they still had a standards violation?
11	MS. COFFMAN: That's correct.
12	MS. NEWTON: And so are they under any kind of
13	probation right now?
14	MS. COFFMAN: They are not.
15	MS. NEWTON: Okay. So apparently they at that
16	time cleared this up?
17	MS. COFFMAN: At that time.
18	MS. NEWTON: This was cleared up?
19	MS. COFFMAN: Yes.
20	MS. NEWTON: Okay. Thank you.
21	CHAIRMAN BARTH: Ms. McFetridge.
22	MS. McFETRIDGE: Ms. Coffman, you talked about
23	bringing in trained counselors to help. How many are
24	you talking about? And are they trained counselors
25	from the Department that you bring in? Can you talk

a little bit about that?

MS. COFFMAN: Yes. We have two persons from our counseling office here at the Department that are prepared to go in this week and begin to assist. And then we've reached out to our partners to say are there retired counselors that we might be able to hire to come in and assist as well. And so we have some that — we have names and numbers, as needed, if — whatever is decided today.

MS. McFETRIDGE: Would they have to be on probationary status in order for you to bring the additional counselors in?

MS. COFFMAN: Well, maybe I need to talk to my
Counselor back here. If there had been an agreement

-- if we had had a relationship going in, we might
could've come to a mutual decision to get that done
together. And we felt like when we went in on
February -- I don't have my date in front of me -February whatever that was and then found out next -the next day that the counselor that was there was
suspended and wasn't supposed to be on-staff that we
weren't sure that what we were being told was the
complete truth. And so at this time I'm not sure
that that relationship would produce the results that
these kids need quick enough.

CHAIRMAN BARTH: All right. Are there 1 2 additional questions? MS. ZOOK: I wondered are any of your board 3 members here? Are any of their board members here? 4 I know Mr. Simpson is on the board at Helena-West 5 6 Helena, but he's not on this board. 7 UNKNOWN MAN IN AUDIENCE: No board members are 8 here. 9 MS. ZOOK: Thank you. CHAIRMAN BARTH: Okay. Yes. Yes, I'm getting 10 11 notes about public comment, so -- yes. 12 SUPT. JOHNSON: Okay. Just --13 CHAIRMAN BARTH: Please -- please come forward. 14 I would like to kind of let her SUPT. JOHNSON: 15 know, as you, we have no problem with that -- anyone 16 coming in to help us. The point is we have now -- we 17 have a retired counselor of over 30 years' experience 18 who worked in Marvell, and she is in this position 19 right at this moment to make certain that we carry 20 out the things that we are telling you we're going to 21 Coming up the first week in April, we're going 22 to get those students who are in the 11th grade, as 23 we have done years to pass [sic] when I worked in Lee 24 County -- we had every student to come, his parent 25 came, and they looked at his transcript, and we made

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2223

24

25

certain it was done correctly so they could get out We don't want to keep them in there over of school. the years they're supposed to be there. concerned very much about them reading. We want them to read too. But we have a plan that we can do this -- but if they're going to help us, we have no So we don't want to establish like we don't problem. have a relationship. We will have a relationship, because we need help wherever we can get it. right now, Ms. McCrae is there and she has already begun talking to all students. And then we have a person who would do the manual stuff of putting the grades and putting the things in order to -- that's Ms. Jarrett.

Now we might look for the new thing that's going to happen with counselors, where they come in and counsel students. But we have the people coming from those services in the school all the time, helping mental and all of those. We've got a lot of those coming in and their parents have assigned them those people to help them. So that's why we don't necessarily need somebody talking to them all the time, but we do need them to be -- go into the right courses. The principal and I will do the scheduling. We just did it in January. We changed it where so

that those 8th graders would get in 8th grade courses, straight-line. And why we haven't gone to the 9th grade is because it was already kind of set But we have people who have talked to the counselor -- and the counselor was there. suspend him, but I had to once I found out it was as But it was not egregious as we were thinking it was. quite that egregious, because we went back to look -to make certain Jim, Sue -- one person they named to me came to that school February 9th. When they came back they found this student, but they still had just No, we didn't have any records on him, because the records hadn't made it to us. So there are issues like that that happen that you're not sure who he is, where he is, and why you haven't gotten the grades on him. We had a student with no grade in 11th grade, but she was at another school. So we did find the part where she had been in another school and now we know she can go on. So it's just small things sometimes like that.

We don't intend to hurt children. We don't intend to hurt children. We intend for them to graduate. And we're not here for the money. If we were, we would probably be at some corporate place. We're not here for money.

22

23

1 CHAIRMAN BARTH: Thank you. 2 SUPT. JOHNSON: We're here to help. And we've 3 been at that school district -- I have for over 30 4 years in that one town. I have a home there. 5 would hate to lose that school district, because we 6 have nothing else in Lee County. 7 So I just want to make sure that you know that 8 individually we know who they are -- one, two, three 9 -- and probably know their momma. 10 CHAIRMAN BARTH: Thank you. 11 MS. ZOOK: Without going --12 CHAIRMAN BARTH: Thank you, Ms. Johnson. 13 MS. ZOOK: Excuse me. Without going into 14 personnel issues, can you tell me why you felt that 15 it was the total responsibility of the counselor and 16 not the principal? 17 SUPT. JOHNSON: Well, I don't think we really 18 felt that way, but that's what has been -- you know 19 how you have a precedent for that. They kept the 20 records, they done this, so you allow them to do 21 that. You don't make them do it; that's just what 22 they feel is their job that they do. Now what has 23 come -- become -- made that job a little bit more 24 difficult is with eSchool. There's so many things to 25 do in eSchool and to keep up with -- send a letter

1 home if he's absent, call the parent, get the grades 2 It's just so much; it's a lot. So what we did, 3 we assigned a person to that. Her name is Ms. 4 Jarrett, as I said. So she had to learn this stuff. Ms. Rhodes is coming to that district this week to 5 6 help her get -- to be a master at this, okay, so she 7 can get the -- and that this matches this, that 8 matches this, so that the students -- we can put it 9 all in one pile what they're doing. But beforehand, 10 you had to do it -- you had to do it here; you had to 11 hand a piece of paper to people. But we are trying 12 to make certain we make this more manageable for the 13 counselor. 14 CHAIRMAN BARTH: Thank you. 15 All right. If there -- thank you, Ms. Johnson. 16 SUPT. JOHNSON: Okay. 17 CHAIRMAN BARTH: Appreciate it very much. 18 PUBLIC COMMENT 19 So if there are no other CHAIRMAN BARTH: 20 questions we do have one request for public comment 21 on this item. And so if the Board is willing I would 22 entertain a motion to hear public comment on this --23 on this item. 24 MS. McFETRIDGE: I move. 25 All right. Motion by Ms. CHAIRMAN BARTH:

1 McFetridge. 2 MR. WILLIAMSON: Second. 3 CHAIRMAN BARTH: Second by Mr. Williamson. All in favor say "aye." (UNANIMOUS CHORUS OF AYES) 5 All right. And so Ms. Stanley 6 CHAIRMAN BARTH: is the one. Welcome. And you will have up to three 8 And the floor is yours. minutes. 9 MS. STANLEY: Dr. Barth, thank you. 10 CHAIRMAN BARTH: Sure. 11 MS. STANLEY: To Commissioner Key, the State 12 Board of Education, my name is Phylistia Stanley and 13 I am the former high school principal at Lee Senior 14 So I wanted to just talk very briefly High School. 15 and give some background on some of the concerns that 16 has transpired in the counselor's office. 17 When the new superintendent took seat, in July, 18 I had actually had conversations with her in 19 reference to the lack of skill-set that I had 20 observed and to the manner where we had transitioned 21 to an intensive support plan. Okay. The 22 superintendent decided to get with the counselor, and 23 they removed the oversight for the counselor from my 24 office. We had secured the services of Mr. Ronnie 25 Hughes to come in. He was there approximately two or

three years to provide that in-depth support in the 2 counselor's office. So I was a little perturbed, if 3 you will, when Ms. Johnson alluded to the former team 4 which I was a part of. So, yes, the support was 5 No, the current superintendent did not support the recommendations that were made to her at 6 7 an open board meeting in Lee County in reference to 8 securing the continued support of Mr. Hughes to 9 provide those services. 10 One of the things that Mr. Hughes and I had done 11 prior to this particular counselor coming onboard is 12 we had conducted transcript audits of each scholar at 13 Lee Senior High School, and after each semester we 14 would update those audits. That information was 15 given to the current counselor. And I had regular 16 check-ins with the counselor to make sure that we 17 were on-track, until the superintendent pulled that 18 from under my umbrella as the high school principal. 19 Thank you very much. 20 CHAIRMAN BARTH: Thank you very much. 21 Appreciate it. 22 So the question before the Board relates 23 to the appeal from the District, whether to uphold 24 that appeal or whether to deny that appeal. 25 MS. ZOOK: I move to deny.

1	MR. WILLIAMSON: Second.
2	CHAIRMAN BARTH: Okay. Motion by Ms. Zook,
3	second by Mr. Williamson.
4	Is there additional discussion on this item?
5	All right. Then, a roll-call on this. The
6	motion is to deny.
7	COMMISSIONER KEY: Ms. Zook.
8	MS. ZOOK: Yes.
9	COMMISSIONER KEY: Dr. Hill.
10	DR. HILL: Yes.
11	COMMISSIONER KEY: Mr. Williamson.
12	MR. WILLIAMSON: Yes.
13	COMMISSIONER KEY: Ms. Chambers.
14	MS. CHAMBERS: Yes.
15	COMMISSIONER KEY: Ms. McFetridge.
16	MS. McFETRIDGE: Yes.
17	COMMISSIONER KEY: Dr. Moore.
18	DR. MOORE: Yes.
19	COMMISSIONER KEY: Ms. Newton.
20	MS. NEWTON: Yes.
21	COMMISSIONER KEY: Ms. Dean.
22	MS. DEAN: Yes.
23	CHAIRMAN BARTH: All right. So that is
24	unanimous, and so the probationary status is
25	affirmed. And I probably should have clarified

1	and that was both for the District and the High
2	School? Was that the intent of everybody in
3	consensus that was the intent?
4	MS. ZOOK: (Nodding head up and down.)
5	MR. WILLIAMSON: (Nodding head up and down.)
6	CHAIRMAN BARTH: I should've
7	MS. ZOOK: Do I need to state that?
8	CHAIRMAN BARTH: I think we're as long as we
9	agree that that was the intent of the I just
10	wanted to clarify that for the record.
11	And so we now need to consider action. I
12	believe there is a recommendation from the
13	Department. Is that from the Commissioner or from
14	COMMISSIONER KEY: Well, I have a
15	recommendation. I'd like Ms. Freno to come and
16	describe the options that are before you, and then
17	I'll follow-up with the recommendation from the
18	Department.
19	MS. FRENO: Lori Freno, Department of Education.
20	There are several actions that the State Board
21	may take and they include requiring a school district
22	to reorganize or reassign the administrative,
23	instructional, or support staff of a public school;
24	require a school or school district to institute and
25	fully implement a curriculum that is based on state

25

academic content and achievement standards, including providing appropriate professional development at the cost to the school district; remove a particular school from the jurisdiction of the school district and establish alternative public governance and supervision of the school; require a school district to close down or dissolve a particular school or schools within the school district; annex the school district -- annex a school district or districts, or part thereof, with another receiving school district or districts pursuant to the authority of 6-13-1401 and this subchapter; consolidate a school district or districts or parts thereof with any school district or districts or parts thereof to form a resulting district; reconstitute the leadership of the school district by removing permanently or suspending on a temporary basis the superintendent of the school district or any particular board members of a school district. The State Board shall have the authority to appoint an administrator or to call a special election of new school district board members to administer the affairs and provide governance of the school district, or both. And, finally, take any other appropriate action allowed by law to assist and address a school or school district's failure to meet

the Standards for Accreditation. 1 2 CHAIRMAN BARTH: Any questions of Ms. Freno? 3 Okay. Thank you. 4 COMMISSIONER KEY: Okay. 5 CHAIRMAN BARTH: Commissioner. 6 COMMISSIONER KEY: Thank you, Dr. Barth. 7 Part of the information that we provided was a timeline and as you see, Lee County School District 8 9 over the last five years has had a lot of history 10 with the Department and the Board. In light of that 11 -- obviously the decision you make today can only be 12 made with respect to this particular item that's 13 before you. But in light of that history and due to 14 the severity of these violations -- history and 15 violations that seem to transcend across various 16 administrators and folks that have been in charge of 17 meeting the needs of students there -- the Department 18 recommends reconstitution of the leadership of the 19 school district according to Arkansas Code 6-15-207 20 by removing permanently the superintendent and the 21 board of directors. Further, the Department 22 recommends the State Board delegate authority to the 23 Commissioner to appoint a person for -- as 24 administrator to the affairs of the District under 25 the supervision of the Commissioner.

1 I'll be glad to take any questions on that 2 recommendation. CHAIRMAN BARTH: We'll start on -- any 3 questions, Dr. Moore? Mr. Williamson? 4 Ms. Zook, any 5 questions? The reconstituting, would that expand 6 MS. ZOOK: 7 beyond central office to the administrators of the school or schools? Or will it -- does that -- your 8 9 recommendation specifically just address central 10 office? 11 COMMISSIONER KEY: The recommendation just follows along with the item number seven of 6-15-12 13 207(c) and it only addresses the superintendent and 14 the board. 15 MS. ZOOK: And do we as State Board members have 16 it within our -- within the letters of the law to go 17 beyond that? 18 COMMISSIONER KEY: I would defer to Ms. Freno on 19 that question. 20 MS. FRENO: Lori Freno. Ms. Zook, it depends 21 upon the action that you -- that the State Board 22 would want to take because (c)(8) is pretty broad, 23 "take any other appropriate action allowed by law to 24 assist and address a school or school district in -for failure to meet the Standards for Accreditation." 25

1	MS. ZOOK: Thank you.
2	CHAIRMAN BARTH: I want to go back to Dr.
3	Moore's previous question about when the the kind
4	of state accountability, what level of support, the
5	recommendation for that. What timeline are we
6	looking at for that for this district in terms of
7	that? Do we have any ideas?
8	MS. COFFMAN: Depending upon the action of the
9	Board today, we'll determine what recommendation that
10	we would take back to the District for the level of
11	support. But we are already in there supporting the
12	district; we just need to ramp it up aggressively.
13	So we would make any adjustment to the level of
14	support based on the actions today.
15	CHAIRMAN BARTH: Okay. All right.
16	Ms. Dean, anything? Okay. Ms. Newton? Ms.
17	McFetridge? Ms. Chambers?
18	MS. CHAMBERS: No. No, sir.
19	CHAIRMAN BARTH: Okay. All right. So you have
20	heard the recommendation from the Department.
21	MS. McFETRIDGE: I'm sorry. Can we hear that
22	again, would you mind?
23	CHAIRMAN BARTH: Sure.
24	COMMISSIONER KEY: It's the recommendation of
25	the Department to reconstitute the leadership of the

1	school district according to Arkansas Code 6-15-207
2	by removing the superintendent and the board of
3	directors. Further, the Department recommends the
4	State Board delegate authority to the Commissioner to
5	appoint an administrator for the affairs of the
6	District under the supervision of the Commissioner.
7	MS. ZOOK: I'm ready with the first motion that
8	may need to be discussed.
9	CHAIRMAN BARTH: Okay. Ms. Zook.
10	MS. ZOOK: I move that we take the
11	recommendation of the Commissioner and the Department
12	and add to that also the principal of the High
13	School.
14	CHAIRMAN BARTH: Ms. Freno, would you like to
15	speak to that, the appropriateness of that addendum?
16	MS. FRENO: Can I have just a moment?
17	CHAIRMAN BARTH: Yeah. Take your time.
18	DR. HILL: Based on your recommendation, when
19	you said it was broad in there, that once you do that
20	you have the latitude to do whatever seems necessary
21	right? Is that correct, Commissioner?
22	COMMISSIONER KEY: Right. What I'm asking is
23	the law says that the Board appoints an
24	administrator.
25	DR. HILL: Right.

1	COMMISSIONER KEY: There are other sections of
2	the law that allows you to delegate that to the
3	Commissioner. And we don't have anyone to present to
4	you today
5	DR. HILL: Correct.
6	COMMISSIONER KEY: for your appointment. So
7	that's why I'm asking for the delegation
8	DR. HILL: Correct.
9	COMMISSIONER KEY: of that authority.
10	DR. HILL: And then that individual can when
11	you say can do whatever is necessary, to make any
12	other changes that they see need fit [sic]. Correct?
13	COMMISSIONER KEY: Subject to the limitations of
14	statute. So when you're dealing with employment
15	DR. HILL: Okay.
16	COMMISSIONER KEY: as we've discussed a
17	number of times, you have limitations.
18	DR. HILL: So is what Ms. Zook is asking for
19	would that have to come from a motion here or could
20	that person who you place in there make that change?
21	COMMISSIONER KEY: I think the removal happens
22	here, if Ms. Freno
23	DR. HILL: Okay.
24	COMMISSIONER KEY: confirms it. The
25	appointment of that person then would be subject to

the administrator that's appointed to -- for the day-1 2 to-day operations. 3 DR. HILL: Okay. That was my question. It's just not perfectly clear from 4 the law what "reconstitution" means. It's the 5 administrative staff. I mean, certainly a principal 6 7 would be under the Teacher Fair Dismissal Act at this juncture. So it's just -- I mean, it's not clear. 8 9 But that's not something -- even if the Board today 10 didn't make a recommendation with regard to the 11 principal, that's something that could be considered 12 at a later time. 13 MS. ZOOK: I guess what I was hearing from the 14 reports is that time is of the essence and that 15 person may be standing in the way of getting that 16 done quickly. 17 Time -- if time -- I mean, time is MS. FRENO: 18 of the essence is what I was hearing as well. certainly under the Teacher Fair Dismissal Act there 19 20 are provisions for which someone covered by the Act can be removed if it's for some kind of -- for cause. 21 22 And that would just be the question is if there is 23 The Teacher Fair Dismissal Act cause to remove them. 24 wouldn't -- I mean, would not bar that. 25 MS. ZOOK: So if a person is in charge of a high

school as the principal and the school is found to be 1 2 in violation -- so therefore, on probation -ultimately that is that person's responsibility, I 3 4 would see that as cause. But I trust you as the attorney to help clarify that for me. 5 That just might be something that MS. FRENO: 6 7 could be looked into as a part of an overall analysis 8 of where the systemic problems came from, what went 9 wrong. That -- I mean, certainly whether or not the 10 principal should be retained could be a part of that 11 inquiry. 12 Dr. Barth, can I make a comment? MS. NEWTON: 13 CHAIRMAN BARTH: Ms. Newton. 14 I have difficulty making personnel MS. NEWTON: 15 discussions in public like this and talking about 16 people who have contracts and I just don't feel like 17 that's appropriate for us. I think that would be 18 appropriate for whoever the new superintendent is and That's my opinion on that. 19 take the proper channels. 20 MS. ZOOK: Yeah. I quess because we have to 21 notify people before May 1st and -- you know, that's 22 why I asked Ms. Freno and the Commissioner to give me 23 quidance about what can and cannot be done, what can 24 we do to help these children the most today. 25 CHAIRMAN BARTH: So --

1	MC NEGRON. And the bone to the state of the t
1	MS. NEWTON: And we have to also respect that
2	we're talking about a specific person. So I have a
3	real problem with that, so
4	MS. ZOOK: Okay.
5	CHAIRMAN BARTH: So just
6	MS. ZOOK: So is the superintendent.
7	CHAIRMAN BARTH: So just to get things focused
8	here a bit, the motion did not as stated, the
9	motion did not get a second. Correct?
10	MS. ZOOK: Correct.
11	CHAIRMAN BARTH: Okay. And so my question is,
12	is there a second to the motion that was stated as it
13	was stated?
14	MR. WILLIAMSON: Second.
15	CHAIRMAN BARTH: Okay. So there is a second to
16	the motion as stated. And it was essentially the
17	recommendation of the Department with the addendum
18	that we've discussed.
19	Additional discussion of this motion before we
20	move to a vote?
21	Dr. Hill.
22	MS. ZOOK: I'm not sure we got a motion made. I
23	think he told what the recommendation
24	CHAIRMAN BARTH: No. You made the motion, Ms.
25	Zook.

1	MS. ZOOK: I know. But it didn't get a second.
2	CHAIRMAN BARTH: Yes, it did.
3	MR. WILLIAMSON: I did it.
4	MS. ZOOK: Oh, I'm sorry. I apologize.
5	CHAIRMAN BARTH: Thank you. Thank you.
6	Dr. Hill.
7	DR. HILL: No, that's okay, that clarified
8	it. I'm good now, now that I know I was confused.
9	CHAIRMAN BARTH: Great. Okay.
10	Is everyone clear on the motion, including Ms.
11	Chambers?
12	DR. HILL: Restate it.
13	CHAIRMAN BARTH: Okay. I will restate the
14	motion.
15	DR. HILL: Restate it.
16	CHAIRMAN BARTH: I'll try to restate it. So the
17	motion is that the Commissioner as the
18	Commissioner stated, under section 6-13 6-15-207,
19	subsection (c)(7) that there would be reconstitution
20	of the leadership of the school district by removing
21	permanently or suspending the superintendent, as well
22	as the entirety of the school board. The Board would
23	provide to the Commissioner the power to appoint a
24	new superintendent for the District. Plus,
25	specifically the superintendent [sic] of the High

School would be removed as part of this -- it would 1 2 be -- the principal, excuse me -- the principal --3 and that would be under it appears Section 8 --4 Subsection (8) below. 5 DR. HILL: No. My question is to the Commissioner. That's what you wanted? 6 7 COMMISSIONER KEY: Our recommendation was the --8 what I mentioned, and Ms. Zook added the principal. 9 DR. HILL: Okay. 10 MS. CHAMBERS: Dr. Barth, can I make a comment 11 or --12 Yes, please. CHAIRMAN BARTH: MS. CHAMBERS: I just wanted to -- I wasn't sure 13 14 the right moment, but I certainly applaud Ms. Zook's 15 sense of urgency on insuring that there's no 16 perceived impediment to moving quickly to get the 17 right things done. But my sentiment aligns with Ms. 18 Newsom [sic], which is -- excuse me -- Newton, which 19 is about this being a bit of an over-reach because we 20 don't have all the facts. We don't know. I'm 21 assuming that the appointee made by the Commissioner, by the Department of Ed. would be able to make that 22 23 determination if it were needed. So I just wanted to 24 offer that point of view. 25 CHAIRMAN BARTH: Okay. Thank you.

Dr. Hill.

DR. HILL: I want to echo that, kind of like what when we were going with the LRSD, when we told the superintendent, you know, "You've got a scalpel and a hatchet." I remember using that. We don't know which one needs to be used because we're not there. And I just think given the person who you select to take that type of leadership in that situation would be the person we would trust to make all those decisions at that time, and that's where I'm most comfortable. But that's just my thought.

CHAIRMAN BARTH: All right.

Ms. Zook.

MS. ZOOK: I'd be happy to withdraw my motion as stated. I do understand the point. I just know that sometimes when we go into districts and we depend on some — the leadership to do things in a timely way that, in my opinion, it's in the best interest of children — it doesn't always happen that quickly. But I'm happy to withdraw the motion with that caveat.

CHAIRMAN BARTH: Okay. So you are withdrawing the motion. Mr. Williamson, you've withdrawn your second?

MR. WILLIAMSON: Yes.

1	CHAIRMAN BARTH: Okay. So there is no motion on
2	the floor.
3	Dr. Hill.
4	DR. HILL: But, no but I'm in I guess I'm
5	in total agreement with you that we must move
6	expeditiously for our children, one-hundred percent.
7	But I guess I will go back and state that person that
8	the Commissioner appoints and if there's no law
9	for that person to move on that day to make it
10	happen, then it can happen almost the same period of
11	time unless the law impedes that. Correct?
12	CHAIRMAN BARTH: Correct.
13	COMMISSIONER KEY: That is correct
14	DR. HILL: Is that correct?
15	CHAIRMAN BARTH: I think that's what Ms. Freno
16	said.
17	DR. HILL: Okay.
18	COMMISSIONER KEY: Dr. Hill.
19	DR. HILL: So because we all I think we
20	all agree that we need intervention immediately.
21	CHAIRMAN BARTH: Okay.
22	MS. NEWTON: I make a motion to accept the
23	recommendation of the Department as stated.
24	CHAIRMAN BARTH: Thank you.
25	MS. DEAN: Second.

1	CHAIRMAN BARTH: Okay. And everybody is clear
2	on this motion?
3	All right. Any additional comments before we
4	move to a roll-call?
5	Okay. Roll-call.
6	COMMISSIONER KEY: Ms. Zook.
7	MS. ZOOK: Yes.
8	COMMISSIONER KEY: Dr. Hill.
9	DR. HILL: Yes.
10	COMMISSIONER KEY: Mr. Williamson.
11	MR. WILLIAMSON: Yes.
12	COMMISSIONER KEY: Ms. Chambers.
13	MS. CHAMBERS: Yes.
14	COMMISSIONER KEY: Ms. McFetridge.
15	MS. McFETRIDGE: Yes.
16	COMMISSIONER KEY: Dr. Moore.
17	DR. MOORE: Yes.
18	COMMISSIONER KEY: Ms. Newton.
19	MS. NEWTON: Yes.
20	COMMISSIONER KEY: Ms. Dean.
21	MS. DEAN: Yes.
22	CHAIRMAN BARTH: Okay. Great. That is
23	unanimous. And we appreciate the work of the folks
24	from the District and we appreciate y'all being here
25	today.

I do have a question for the Commissioner in terms of what expected timeline we should have about leadership.

COMMISSIONER KEY: Yes. I would -- and thank you for that. I was going to ask if you would allow me to kind of talk about next steps.

So Dr. Hernandez, State Superintendent/Office of Coordinated Support and Service and his team will immediately take on the role, for at least the remainder of this week. And we anticipate by first of next week identifying someone to be appointed to be the superintendent.

I don't know if -- I know y'all noticed ForwARd Arkansas is here, and I want to talk about what we will be asking ForwARd Arkansas to do. They have relationships; they have work that they have established in Lee County. We are going to -- I am going to ask that they continue that work and maybe even ramp it up. And we will work with them to determine how we can do that to build support within the community for what needs to happen for the longterm benefit of the students of Lee County.

Certainly, Ms. Johnson's appeal -- when she said that the school is what they have, it's the only thing they have, and we understand that and we do not

2

3

4

5

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

want that to go away. It is not our intention whatsoever to see a situation where the Lee County School District -- the Lee County Trojans -- the essence that -- there in Marianna, that it is not our intent for that to go away. It is our intent for that to be built back up for long-term benefit.

We have learned a lot over the last few years. Those of you that -- I think Ms. Zook, Dr. Barth, you may be the only two members remaining on the Board in the last academic distress action that the Board had to take with Lee County. We've learned a lot about how to help districts get better. And as you know, the old version of academic distress -- the old methodology did not work well to prepare a long-term foundation for success. We know better now how to do that and it is our intention and commitment to work with the personnel, the students and the parents, primarily, and with the community through the help of supporters like -- and support network like ForwARd Arkansas and others to establish that foundation for long-term success.

So starting with Dr. Hernandez, moving on. And we'll make you -- notify you as soon as we identify a person that would step in, as I said, hopefully at the beginning of next week to begin that work.

_

In the meantime, not just Dr. Hernandez but, as Ms. Coffman mentioned, the full resources of the Department with standards and systems support, as well as our -- Mr. Ford, Ms. Knowles, the team from the counseling unit in the Department, and any others -- curriculum -- any others that we need will be directed to provide whatever support is necessary.

CHAIRMAN BARTH: So I do thank Dr. Hernandez and the folks from ForwARd for your work.

I do have a couple of additional questions. Do we have a -- as part of this strategy do we have a communication plan to the faculty, staff, students, and then parents of the District?

Obviously, there are certain things we did not prepare before knowing what the decision of the Board would be, but that is one of the first things that will happen. We have an operating procedure now, that we did not have before, that takes place during a takeover and that -- you know, communication is first and foremost one of those things that will be taking place; nuts and bolts, issues of bank accounts, issues with all those types of things, of the day-to-day operations. So, yes, that is going to take place.

1 I also want to point out that the team from the 2 co-op is there, the educational service co-op there, 3 Crowley's Ridge, which is -- I mean, not Crowley's Ridge -- Great Rivers Co-op, which they are a member, 4 5 is here, present, and I want to express appreciation for them being present. But they will also be part 6 7 of this effort of bringing support into that 8 district. 9 CHAIRMAN BARTH: Thanks. Ms. Coffman, did you have anything you wanted to 10 11 add? 12 MS. COFFMAN: No. 13 CHAIRMAN BARTH: Okay. All right. Are there 14 any additional questions? 15 Okay. All right. Thank y'all very much for 16 being here. And I think that action item is ended 17 for today, but the action is not ended for today as 18 we move forward in Lee County. So, good luck to all 19 of you. 20 All right. Are y'all good to move to the next? 21 Thank y'all. 22 Are y'all ready to move? 23 Okay. So our second item on the agenda is an 24 issue that arose when we were in Springdale two weeks 25 ago, and this is the --

1 MS. ZOOK: Can we take a break while they're --CHAIRMAN BARTH: Okay. Let's take a -- just a 2 3 very brief 3- to 5-minute break. 4 (BREAK: 12:05 - 12:12 p.m.) (COURT REPORTER'S NOTE: Action Item A-2, a 5 6 report on Act 1240 and charter school waivers, was heard, but no board action was taken. It may be 8 viewed on the ADE website.) 9 COVENANT KEEPERS CHARTER SCHOOL SUBPOENA A-3: 10 CHAIRMAN BARTH: The final item, which is an 11 action item, is the subpoena related to Covenant Keepers. And I'll let Ms. Hyatt walk us through this 12 13 issue. 14 MS. HYATT: You all should have a copy -- I put 15 a copy of the draft order and the draft of the 16 subpoena on your desk before you got here. So I'm 17 going to go through just a little bit of background, 18 explaining why this is necessary, and then I'll be 19 happy to answer any questions. 20 In January -- on January 15th is when the 21 charter authorizer accepted the voluntary non-renewal 22 of the Covenant Keepers charter. So then the 23 Department started working with Covenant Keepers/City 24 of Fire Community Development and Friendship, who was 25

running the school, to kind of wind down the school.

On the 29th of January the Department sent a letter to the school asking for a list of information, including account numbers and financial information, contact information for all the accounts that they did have, a list of debts, and other financial records. We didn't receive anything.

Sometime between the 29th, when that letter was sent, and the 7th of February there were some items removed from the Covenant Keepers campus, including some filing cabinets.

On the 7th of February we asked again for the things from our letter in January, including the financial records, and received nothing back.

On the 15th is when this Board immediately revoked the charter and we stepped in and began an emergency inventory of all of their property and financial records.

It was discovered between the 15th of February and the 1st of March that the filing cabinets that were removed included financial documents and information that was necessary to pay debts, do an audit of the school, and to have records of all the finances of the school.

On the 1st of March we sent a letter requesting the records by the 6th of March.

On the 6th of March I received an email from Ms. Tatum indicating her refusal to turn over the records and indicating a wish to keep original copies of the records for her own recordkeeping. That same day I responded and requested copies of all the records or in the alternative asked to set up a time that we could come and inspect the records and make our own copies, and I received no response.

Since that date I made several calls to the attorney that she said was representing her; was notified that that attorney was not representing her. I attempted to make phone calls to Ms. Tatum herself; was not able to leave a voice-mail. I received no response, and also received no response to emails or any of the written communications that were sent.

Arkansas Code 6-17-425 allows this board to issue a subpoena, which is what we are requesting that you do -- issue a subpoena for Ms. Tatum so that she would be compelled to produce the financial documents that are missing. So the subpoena that you have in front of you would allow her either to produce them by April 5th or, if not produced by April 5th, would compel her to attend the April 11th Board meeting to produce the documents. The other thing that you have in that packet is the order that

1	our operating procedures say that the Board issues a
2	subpoena by order; so that will be an order Dr. Barth
3	would sign outlining the facts that I just recited in
4	ordering the issuance of this subpoena.
5	CHAIRMAN BARTH: Okay. Are there any questions
6	on this?
7	All right. To my left?
8	This is a somewhat extraordinary action. I
9	can't remember doing this before. So this is new
10	stuff because of an important issue.
11	Ms. Chambers, any questions?
12	MS. CHAMBERS: No questions.
13	CHAIRMAN BARTH: All right. So the proper
14	motion is to pass the order as or to affirm the
15	order as laid out, which would activate the subpoena
16	process. Correct?
17	MS. HYATT: Yes. And I have non-draft copies
18	for your signature if it passes.
19	CHAIRMAN BARTH: Okay. All right. I will
20	entertain a motion on this issue.
21	MS. DEAN: I move to affirm the order.
22	MS. NEWTON: Second.
23	CHAIRMAN BARTH: Motion by Ms. Dean, second by
24	Ms. Newton to affirm the order.
25	All do a roll-call to be safe.

1	COMMISSIONER KEY: Ms. Zook.
2	MS. ZOOK: Yes.
3	COMMISSIONER KEY: Dr. Hill.
4	DR. HILL: Yes.
5	COMMISSIONER KEY: Mr. Williamson.
6	MR. WILLIAMSON: Yes.
7	COMMISSIONER KEY: Ms. Chambers.
8	MS. CHAMBERS: Yes.
9	COMMISSIONER KEY: Ms. McFetridge.
10	MS. McFETRIDGE: Yes.
11	COMMISSIONER KEY: Dr. Moore.
12	DR. MOORE: Yes.
13	COMMISSIONER KEY: Ms. Newton.
14	MS. NEWTON: Yes.
15	COMMISSIONER KEY: Ms. Dean.
16	MS. DEAN: Yes.
17	CHAIRMAN BARTH: Okay. Unanimous.
18	All right. Okay. That's the conclusion of our
19	action, but we do have one other public comment.
20	(COURT REPORTER'S NOTE: A public comment was
21	heard. It may be viewed on the ADE website.)
22	CHAIRMAN BARTH: All right. I will entertain a
23	motion to adjourn.
24	MS. ZOOK: So moved.
25	MS. DEAN: Second.

1	CHAIRMAN BARTH: Motion by Ms. Zook, second by
2	Ms. Dean.
3	All in favor say "aye."
4	(UNANIMOUS CHORUS OF AYES)
5	CHAIRMAN BARTH: Opposed, same sign.
6	(COURT REPORTER'S NOTE: There was no
7	opposition.)
8	
9	
10	(The meeting was concluded at 12:30 p.m.)
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	