

ARKANSAS DIVISION OF  
ELEMENTARY AND SECONDARY EDUCATION  
CHARTER AUTHORIZING PANEL

NOVEMBER 15, 2022

9:00 a.m.

A P P E A R A N C E S

PANEL MEMBERS:

MS. DEBORAH COFFMAN	Chairperson/ADE Asst. Commissioner - Public School Accountability
MR. PHIL BALDWIN	Retired Bank Executive
MS. KARLI SARACINI	ADE Asst. Commissioner - Educator Effectiveness & Licensure
DR. SONJA WRIGHT-McMURRAY	Division of CTE Associate Director
MS. TOYCE NEWTON	Former State Board of Education Member
MR. KIM DAVIS	Former State Board of Education Member

ADE LEGAL COUNSEL:

MS. WHITNEY JAMES	DESE Attorney
MS. SHASTADY WAGNER	DESE Attorney

ALSO APPEARING:

MS. DORIE SUMMONS	DESE Charter Schools Director
MS. TIFFANY GRAYER	DESE Coordinator of School Performance

LOCATION:

ARKANSAS DIVISION OF ELEMENTARY AND SECONDARY EDUCATION  
- Auditorium  
#4 Capitol Mall  
Little Rock, Arkansas

I N D E X

	Page
Preliminary Matters. . . . .	3
Consent Agenda . . . . .	3
Action Agenda:	
1) Review of Open Enrollment Charter Schools . . . . .	4
2) Review of District Conversion Charter Schools. . . . .	48
New Business . . . . .	54
Adjournment . . . . .	55
Court Reporter's Certificate . . . . .	57

## P R O C E E D I N G S

1  
2 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: Good morning. The November  
3 15, 2022, meeting of the Charter Authorizing Panel is  
4 called to order. I'd like to welcome everyone to the  
5 Department of Ed. and ask that you please silence all  
6 of your electronic devices.

7 Happy Holidays, Friends. Next week is  
8 Thanksgiving. It's here before we know it.

9 Just as a quick reminder, we will have two days  
10 in December to look through renewals. So hopefully  
11 you've got those two days marked on your calendar,  
12 and I know Dorie will try to get that agenda up as  
13 quickly as possible.

## 14 CONSENT AGENDA

15 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: So today, as we're looking  
16 through our agenda we will start with our Consent  
17 Agenda. Ms. Summons has updated the minutes with the  
18 most current revised version. If you've not looked  
19 at those, take a moment to look at those.

20 DR. WRIGHT-McMURRAY: I move approval.

21 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: I have a motion.

22 MS. SARACINI: I second.

23 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: All right. I have a motion  
24 by Ms. Wright-McMurray and a second by Ms. Saracini  
25 to approve the minutes as presented.

1 All those in favor?

2 (MAJORITY CHORUS OF AYES)

3 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: Did we hear from our -- give  
4 me a thumbs-up or something up there, Ms. Newton and  
5 Mr. Davis.

6 MR. DAVIS: Aye.

7 MS. NEWTON: Can you hear me?

8 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: Perfect. Thank you.

9 All right. Motion carries.

10 ACTION AGENDA

11 1) REVIEW OF OPEN ENROLLMENT CHARTER SCHOOLS

12 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: With our action agenda today  
13 we will be reviewing our charters. This is an  
14 opportunity that we take each year. We just released  
15 our ESSA School Index. This gives you an opportunity  
16 to look over all of the charters. And we've done it  
17 different ways in the past, but what we hope to  
18 accomplish today is that we can hear from the Charter  
19 Panel the questions that you might ask the Charter  
20 Office to go and investigate, instead of dragging all  
21 the schools up to make reports -- that maybe we send  
22 our Office of Charter out to them to put together the  
23 reports and bring those in and then use our time with  
24 the schools that need us the most.

25 So Ms. Tiffany Grayer is our Coordinator of

1 School Performance, and I'd asked Tiffany to put  
2 together a very short presentation about charters and  
3 about our ESSA School Index. So, Ms. Grayer.

4 MS. GRAYER: Thank you, Ms. Coffman, for having  
5 me here today.

6 So the Office of School Performance and --

7 MR. DAN DAVIS: Just one second. I've got to --

8 MS. GRAYER: Sorry.

9 MR. DAN DAVIS: -- get it where they'll be able  
10 to see it.

11 MS. GRAYER: The Office of Public School  
12 Accountability's School Performance Unit puts out a  
13 series of nested reports. Two of those, just  
14 recently released to the public just last week, are  
15 Public School Rating, which is our Accountability-at-  
16 a-Glance report that just came out for the first time  
17 since 2019, which included our letter grades. Those  
18 came out, as well as our ESSA School Index. So our  
19 Accountability-at-a-Glance Report, our school  
20 ratings, that's our state accountability system;  
21 whereas, our ESSA School Index is our federal  
22 accountability system. So both of those reports were  
23 just recently released this November. In just a few  
24 weeks, we will be sending out notification letters to  
25 districts regarding their state and federal

1 accountability statuses, as well as their  
2 participation statuses. In December, we will put out  
3 our school report card, at least the first version of  
4 that, which will include much broader data about the  
5 school. The school report card includes 18 modules.  
6 The full school report card will be out April -- by  
7 April 15, 2023. There is some lagging data that  
8 comes in through Cycle 5, so we do have two versions  
9 that we put out of our school report card.

10 The ESSA School Index includes multiple measures  
11 -- multiple robust indicators which include  
12 achievement, growth, graduation rates, and school  
13 quality and student success components. The main  
14 focus of the ESSA School Index is achievement and  
15 growth. The stakeholders stress the importance of  
16 growth, and so it was weighted at 50% of the  
17 elementary and middle school levels.

18 Here we see the different weights of the  
19 different ESSA School Index calculations. The  
20 weighted achievement is 35%, regardless of the grade  
21 span of the school. The SQSS is 15%, regardless of  
22 the grade span of the school. The growth varies, as  
23 I've already said. It's 50% at middle school and  
24 elementary; it's 35% at the high school. And then we  
25 have the graduation rate indicator coming in, 10% for

1 four-year, 5% for the fifth year at the high school  
2 grade span.

3 Here we see the overall ESSA School Index state  
4 averages. This gives you some trend data to look at.  
5 In 2018, you see the breakdown for the different  
6 grade spans and how that was starting to progress in  
7 2019. And we see the impact of the pandemic; we did  
8 not have test scores in 2020, which you see that  
9 skipped year here. But we do see that in 2022 we are  
10 starting to see some rebounding from the effects of  
11 that pandemic in our scores, although we are not back  
12 to where we were pre-pandemic.

13 We do put out a Schools on the Move report in  
14 our Office of School Performance every year, but I  
15 wanted to put out a special report for our -- both  
16 our open enrollment and our district conversion  
17 charter schools; so this is a little bit personalized  
18 just for them. The full report can be seen on the  
19 School Performance website, but this is targeted for  
20 the open enrollment and district conversion charter  
21 schools. So we saw 45 of those open enrollment and  
22 district conversion charter school improve their  
23 overall ESSA School Index score from 2021 to 2022,  
24 and seven of those open enrollment and district  
25 conversion charter schools actually increased their

1 overall ESSA School Index score by 5 or more points.

2 Let me read some statistics here:

3 Cave City High Career and College Preparatory  
4 School in Cave City School District, they actually  
5 increased their overall ESSA School Index score by  
6 5.17 points. So these -- Cave City Career and  
7 Collegiate Preparatory was recognized as a 2022  
8 School on the Move Towards Excellence. So  
9 congratulations to them.

10 Miner Academy, Bauxite School District was  
11 recognized for both overall ESSA School Index and  
12 weighted achievement. They had an overall ESSA  
13 School Index improvement of 6.22 points, and a  
14 weighted achievement increase of 10.09 points. So  
15 congratulations to Miner Academy of Bauxite School  
16 District.

17 Next, we have Future School of Fort Smith in  
18 Future School of Fort Smith School District. They  
19 had 5.99 points of increase in their overall ESSA  
20 School Index, as well as 17.7 points of increase in  
21 their weighted achievement score for 2021 to 2022.  
22 So congratulations to Future School of Fort Smith.

23 Next, just to let you know a little bit more  
24 about weighted achievement, weighted achievement  
25 measures what each student knows and is able to do in

1 both English Language Arts and mathematics.

2 So these are the state averages of the weighted  
3 achievement scores by grade span. Just like we saw  
4 with our overall ESSA School Index scores -- well,  
5 actually, the weighted achievement was declining a  
6 little bit, but it did take a hit in that 2021 school  
7 year where you're seeing the effects of the pandemic.  
8 But weighted achievement, especially if you look in  
9 that elementary bar, has actually increased quite a  
10 bit this year and is actually back kind of where we  
11 were pre-pandemic. So weighted achievement is doing  
12 pretty good for 2022. We do have some schools that  
13 we'd like to recognize for their increases in  
14 weighted achievement this year. Fifty-eight open  
15 enrollment and district conversion charter schools  
16 showed an increase in their weighted achievement  
17 score this year, and we had six open enrollment and  
18 district conversion charter schools that increased  
19 their weighted achievement score by 10 or more  
20 points, one of them being elementary, two middle  
21 school, and three high school.

22 Friendship Aspire Elementary Academy of Little  
23 Rock in Friendship Aspire School District increased  
24 their overall ESSA School Index score by 9.01 points  
25 and they had a weighted achievement increase score,

1 guys, 23.83 points. That is to be, you know,  
2 acknowledged right there. So congratulations to  
3 Friendship Aspire Elementary Academy of Little Rock.

4 Next, we have KIPP Delta Collegiate Preparatory  
5 of KIPP Delta School District. They had an overall  
6 ESSA Index of -- increase of 7.47 points and a  
7 weighted achievement increase of 12.93 points. So  
8 way to go, KIPP Delta College Preparatory School.

9 Next, we have value-added growth. Value-added  
10 growth is a measure of a student's progress over  
11 time. We're looking at a student's prior year scores  
12 and making a prediction of where they're going to  
13 score in the current year based on those previous  
14 year scores. And so here is a picture of where  
15 growth is at the state level. And as you can see,  
16 growth is one of those scores that is remaining  
17 relatively stable. Which, you know, growth kind of  
18 throws out all of those biases such as poverty, a  
19 student's background, things of that nature, so you  
20 would think that this score would remain relatively  
21 stable. So we do recognize Schools on the Move.  
22 This is the only recognition that's not comparative  
23 from year-to-year; we're looking at schools that's  
24 gross score falls outside of the range of normal. So  
25 scores that score -- schools that score two standard

1 deviations above the average are recognized for  
2 exceptional growth.

3 So we had one open enrollment district -- or  
4 district conversion charter school, middle school,  
5 that scored 84.71 or better, and two open enrollment  
6 or district conversion charter schools that scored  
7 83.85 or better for growth. And those schools are --

8 Well, eStem East Village Junior Public High  
9 School -- or Public Charter School was one of those.  
10 They also had some other recognitions. They had a  
11 recognition for overall ESSA School Index, increase  
12 of 7.74 points; they had a weighted achievement  
13 increase for 10 -- of 10.73 points; and they had a  
14 value-added growth score of 86.14 points. This  
15 district also had eStem Junior High Public Charter  
16 School recognized for their overall ESSA Index of --  
17 increase of 5.15 points. That was eStem School  
18 District.

19 We also have recognitions for growth for Haas  
20 Hall Academy School District. Haas Hall Academy at  
21 the Lane had a value-added growth score of 84.43  
22 points. And Haas Hall Bentonville had a value-added  
23 growth score of 85.84 points.

24 So those are our 2022 Schools on the Move  
25 recognitions for open enrollment and district

1 conversion charters. So congratulations to all of  
2 those schools for the exceptional growth that their  
3 students are making from 2021 to 2022.

4 Oh, we have one more -- I'm sorry -- based on  
5 school rating. So those are all from 2021 to 2022.  
6 These next ones will be comparing actually from 2019  
7 to 2022, because that's the length of time it's been  
8 since we've had letter grades. So our school rating,  
9 you know, is a letter grade that has been transformed  
10 from our ESSA School Index score and it's -- and then  
11 we also -- on this report we also break down the ESSA  
12 School Index for each of our reporting subgroups.  
13 And this is our --

14 MS. NEWTON: I have a question.

15 MS. GRAYER: Yes.

16 MS. NEWTON: Can I ask a question before you  
17 move on to the 9th grade?

18 MS. GRAYER: Absolutely.

19 MS. NEWTON: In the -- what we would consider  
20 the community of charters, whether they be conversion  
21 or whether they be other charters -- and how are  
22 lessons learned being shared for those schools that  
23 -- so is there a community approach to sharing  
24 information of best practices or for someone -- not  
25 necessarily one school is telling another, but for

1 the State Department to be able to say these are some  
2 things that are happening and this area is seeing  
3 help in this way? I think this whole -- I thought  
4 this -- I think that's the whole point of charters,  
5 to be able to share lessons learned and be able to  
6 have a broader application of techniques. So is that  
7 something that happens?

8 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: So, Ms. Newton, last  
9 Wednesday, we had an open public meeting, an  
10 accountability report to the public and it was live-  
11 streamed. It's been recorded. We can send you that  
12 recording, as well. But it was an opportunity for  
13 principals and superintendents to come and talk about  
14 what they've been doing. And some of the schools  
15 that were featured on Schools on the Move were there  
16 to talk about the things that they were doing. Some  
17 talked about PLCs; they talked about the real  
18 differentiation, the focus of attention they were  
19 providing to each student; some of them talked about  
20 just the questions they were asking themselves about  
21 where they're going in the future in their School  
22 Improvement Plans. They're looking at their  
23 calendars; they've been looking at how they collect  
24 and report data. It was really a great conversation.  
25 But to your point, that was one of the ways that the

1 communities have come together to share. And then I  
2 know our co-ops bring in schools and they've been  
3 having conversations because they've been asking Ms.  
4 Grayer to come out and do presentations for them.

5 MS. GRAYER: Also, this report has been going on  
6 for several years and we interview the schools, the  
7 featured schools every year and we do a write-up on  
8 those schools that we -- of the superintendents and  
9 principals that we interview. And that's available  
10 on the Schools on the Move website.

11 MS. NEWTON: Thank you.

12 MS. GRAYER: Yes, ma'am.

13 So the last recognition that we do is for letter  
14 grade increases from 2019 to 2022. We had 50 schools  
15 in the state of Arkansas that improved their letter  
16 grade in that span of time. And one district  
17 conversion charter school -- or actually one charter  
18 school improved from a C to a B.

19 Here's our statewide ratings by grade span. As  
20 you can see, we have our elementary, middle and our  
21 high school grade spans. Here to show you kind of  
22 what our A to F breakdown looks like, and here is our  
23 one school that moved from C to B was Cross County  
24 High A New Tech School in Cross County School  
25 District. That was our one school that made a letter

1 grade increase this year. So congratulations to that  
2 school.

3 And like I said, the full Schools on the Move  
4 report can be found on the School Performance webpage  
5 under Public School Accountability. So please go  
6 check out that report, watch the report to the public  
7 that we sent out last Wednesday, if you want to hear  
8 the interviews from those principals and  
9 superintendents.

10 So thank you for your time. Here's my contact  
11 information if you have any questions about anything  
12 ESSA.

13 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: Thank you, Ms. Grayer.

14 Ms. Wright-McMurray, any questions for Ms.  
15 Grayer?

16 DR. WRIGHT-McMURRAY: I'm trying to think how to  
17 get my question together. So I'm trying to think  
18 back to the slide that you shared where you showed  
19 quite a bit of growth for elementary schools. Do you  
20 mind to go back to that one slide?

21 MS. GRAYER: I think it was the weighted  
22 achievement slide. This one?

23 DR. WRIGHT-McMURRAY: Uh-huh. So after I saw  
24 that, and then going back through some of my other  
25 notes and looking at some of the letter grades for

1 our elementary charters and trying to get a sense of  
2 the ones that aren't doing as well, can you give us a  
3 little bit more detail or help me better understand  
4 how does this reflect in what we're seeing here in  
5 some of the elementary schools that did not do very  
6 well and are either still at D's or F's or declined  
7 to a D or F? I know I'm not quite asking that -- but  
8 I'm just trying to see how does that translate into  
9 that?

10 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: Sure. So, first of all, this  
11 -- these are state averages.

12 MS. GRAYER: Yes.

13 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: So you're taking in all  
14 1,000-plus schools into these averages and you're  
15 looking at a very small number here. I think each  
16 charter would tell you probably a different story of  
17 what's going on. We saw a lot of -- during the  
18 pandemic we saw kids moving around from school to  
19 school. You know, we heard many of our virtual  
20 schools come in and make tremendous increases in  
21 their enrollment cap, and they experienced unusual  
22 circumstances from people signing their kids up for a  
23 virtual school and not really knowing what a virtual  
24 school was. So I think there has been a lot of  
25 movement of kids. I think there have been kids sign

1 up for virtual learning that really didn't have maybe  
2 the background support for virtual learning. I think  
3 we've talked to many of the charter schools this year  
4 that, you know, we're back to onsite instruction and  
5 the kids are not coming every day. So we see our  
6 attendance data showing that kids are not  
7 participating every day -- and, you know, when  
8 they're not participating every day then they may not  
9 be learning every day. So I think it's varied by  
10 school.

11 Would you agree?

12 MS. GRAYER: Yes.

13 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: And that's kind of the gist

14 --

15 MS. GRAYER: Because --

16 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: -- of what we've heard.

17 MS. GRAYER: Because what we haven't seen are  
18 other measures in ESSA that have gone down in the  
19 pandemic, even though this one has gone up. And so  
20 that -- you know, even though the weights are not the  
21 same -- and this one isn't -- you know, it is -- it's  
22 back up in elementary, but it's down in middle  
23 school, high school. And like she's saying, these  
24 are just state averages; so that even though it may  
25 be higher for some, it's going to be lower for

1 others. So --

2 DR. WRIGHT-McMURRAY: I think what initially  
3 caught my attention, even when I was looking at these  
4 --

5 MS. GRAYER: So what you would really want to  
6 look at would be the overall average and not just one  
7 indicator.

8 DR. WRIGHT-McMURRAY: Uh-huh. Yeah. But --

9 MS. GRAYER: Because that's what's going to  
10 determine how many A-to-F's you have, is the overall.  
11 And so if you look at the overall index, you can see  
12 that that overall average is still not where it was  
13 the last time we had letter grades, right, which is  
14 going to pull that scale down.

15 DR. WRIGHT-McMURRAY: So I guess what triggered  
16 the question first for me -- and then I started going  
17 through the rest of the list -- so I was just looking  
18 at Academics Plus. And so if we look at their other  
19 elementary and their high school, you know, they're  
20 still doing pretty good there. But then when you  
21 look at the Scott Elementary School, it's a D. So I  
22 was just trying to figure out if they're in the same  
23 area and that was a -- I guess it's not a traditional  
24 campus. I'm trying to get my mind wrapped -- as  
25 we're looking at who we need to have to come in and

1 talk and to provide a little bit more detail, what  
2 are some of the things we need to be kind of looking  
3 at or helping the charter team to be able to ask  
4 those questions for us. Because when I was looking  
5 at that yesterday and I think last week, those jumped  
6 out at me as, okay, this is Maumelle Academics Plus;  
7 they're doing well over here, but over here, you  
8 know, they're not doing as well. And then I saw  
9 that, even looking at they're doing well at their  
10 high school but the high school numbers are lower, so  
11 they're figuring it out there. But for some reason  
12 they're having the challenge of figuring it out for  
13 the elementary students that seem to be doing better  
14 than even the middle and the high school, according  
15 to all the charts that were showed there. So I was  
16 just trying to get my mind wrapped around that.

17 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: Yeah. I think that's going to  
18 be very specific to that school. That's a great  
19 question.

20 MS. GRAYER: Theoretically, what should help is  
21 the more you see an upward trend in your achievement  
22 the more it should pull your growth. Right? So, and  
23 that's going to help a lot in your elementary since  
24 that's counting for 50%. So you want to see  
25 repetitive increase.

1 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: And then we can know more --  
2 you'd have to pull up the ESSA School Index --

3 MS. GRAYER: Yeah.

4 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: -- for Scott Elementary --

5 MS. GRAYER: Yeah.

6 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: -- and really look at --

7 MS. GRAYER: And see, because --

8 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: -- all of the indicators.

9 MS. GRAYER: And you'd want to see it at the  
10 student level, because that's where it's being  
11 calculated, where -- for each student.

12 DR. WRIGHT-McMURRAY: So just -- that was what I  
13 was wanting the information about to get a better  
14 sense of what's going on.

15 MS. GRAYER: Yeah. This is just a birds-eye  
16 view, when it's really being calculated down at the  
17 student level for each student, what's happening for  
18 each kid.

19 MS. SARACINI: I think it goes back to --

20 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: Turn your microphone on.

21 MS. SARACINI: I think it's looking at the two  
22 A's versus the D, and it's looking up at how do you  
23 -- it's looking and asking the right questions, what  
24 are they doing differently.

25 MS. GRAYER: Uh-huh. Yeah. And that's why, as

1 Ms. Coffman said, when we were interviewing these  
2 students -- the superintendents and principals of  
3 these schools that have really shown a lot of  
4 improvement, what they're doing is they're having  
5 data talks that involve the students and getting them  
6 involved in that conversation and the parents  
7 involved in that conversation, and not just having  
8 those conversations with the teachers. Because it's  
9 them being accountable for their test scores and  
10 their data, because it affects them and, you know,  
11 they have to be aware of where they're at and where  
12 they need to be and how they're going to get there to  
13 show that movement. And I think that's where it's  
14 going to really start to pay off.

15 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: I think one of the other  
16 things that I would add from that conversation last  
17 Wednesday was the schools that talked about not only  
18 they were having those data talks, but that students  
19 were really taking on ownership --

20 MS. GRAYER: Yes.

21 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: -- of charting their own  
22 progress.

23 MS. GRAYER: Yes.

24 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: And, you know, Hattie's  
25 research tells us that has a high effect size in

1 progress. So I think they're living proof that when  
2 kids really know where they are, what they are good  
3 at, what they need to work on, and they're able to  
4 monitor their own progress --

5 MS. GRAYER: Yeah.

6 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: -- they really take ownership  
7 of their own learning.

8 MS. GRAYER: Yes.

9 DR. WRIGHT-McMURRAY: Thank you.

10 MS. GRAYER: Uh-huh.

11 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: Ms. Saracini, do you have  
12 questions at this time?

13 MS. SARACINI: No, ma'am.

14 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: All right. Mr. Baldwin?

15 MR. BALDWIN: So when you look at all the data,  
16 I guess I'm looking at what we've been handed out and  
17 I'm trying to more analyze that. With Covid and with  
18 this period of time that was strange and awkward, it  
19 seems like there's a lot of schools that have had  
20 decreases, but there are some that held steady and  
21 even improved. How would you advise us to weigh the  
22 trajectory of schools and the quality of the data? I  
23 mean, is this data still kind of influx? And do we  
24 really need to wait for another year or two to really  
25 let Covid work its way out? And, you know, the huge

1 enrollment increases and maybe enrollment decreases  
2 -- and I guess help us -- help me understand how to  
3 read this.

4 MS. GRAYER: I think the data is valid and  
5 reliable, and I think that, you know, we've had great  
6 testing participation rates throughout 2021 and 2022.  
7 We've been testing at, you know, 97% statewide for  
8 2021, and we're back to 99% for 2022. And that's  
9 really great, especially compared to the rest of the  
10 nation. And so I think we have a great  
11 accountability system here in Arkansas, that we can  
12 count on. And, you know, so if we are -- we have  
13 schools that are struggling we need to go back to our  
14 core curriculum, our core instruction and make sure  
15 things are tight there; make sure we have good  
16 teaching in place. It all really goes back to  
17 teaching and learning and the conversations we're  
18 just having.

19 MR. BALDWIN: Okay. So the school that's gone  
20 from a C to an F doesn't really have an excuse?

21 MS. GRAYER: Well, I'm not saying that -- well,  
22 one of the great things that I took from the meeting  
23 the other day was -- I wouldn't say don't have an  
24 excuse, but let's just not have an excuse; let's make  
25 a plan to do things better going forward.

1           CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: I think one of the things to  
2 add too is our takeaway is there was expected  
3 learning loss --

4           MS. GRAYER: Yes.

5           CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: -- during the pandemic. And  
6 we know that because U.S. Ed released ARP ESSER funds  
7 and set aside a requirement that each school set  
8 aside 20% to address learning loss. So it was  
9 nationally expected. Some of our schools had less or  
10 more learning loss, depending on the situation for  
11 their students; you know, did they have, you know,  
12 good accessibility, good support systems; did they  
13 come back quickly to school when school opened back  
14 up. Lots of factors that may have played into their  
15 scores. But I don't think any of our schools have  
16 looked for an excuse.

17          MS. GRAYER: Right.

18          CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: I think as Ms. Grayer said,  
19 they've all talked about their plan of action to  
20 address the learning loss and move forward.

21          MS. GRAYER: And we have lots of supports, you  
22 know, out there for schools looking for the plan.

23          CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: Ms. Newton, questions?

24          MS. NEWTON: (Shaking head from side to side.)

25          CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: Mr. Davis, questions?

1           MR. DAVIS: This is -- a couple of comments more  
2 than questions. I think a little bit of the  
3 challenge with some of the presentation is this idea  
4 on one hand that you're looking across the state, but  
5 then in other instances you're sort of drilling down  
6 into the charter world. Right? So it's almost like  
7 you're not necessarily comparing -- in some  
8 instances, we're highlighting some charter work, but  
9 then we're looking across the state. So I'm not sure  
10 if like that's tracking for me. Like it might be --  
11 or, for example, in this slide it might be great if  
12 there are the state averages but also the charter  
13 averages. Right? And so you can kind of see, okay,  
14 this is where the state is and this is where our  
15 charters are in regards to weighted achievement.  
16 Right? And over the course of some time. So just to  
17 -- and I'm always careful because I don't want to get  
18 into this charter versus, but I think if we're going  
19 to include kind of the charter data within the  
20 overall state data and we're a Charter Authorizing  
21 Panel, we do want to kind of pull out and sort of  
22 see. So that's my first comment.

23           The second comment that I had is help me wrap my  
24 mind around how I should think about some of the  
25 things that were highlighted here, but then take a

1 look at some of the letter grade scores. So, for  
2 example, Future School of Fort Smith -- right -- I  
3 mean we applaud them in this presentation. But when  
4 I look at their letter grade score it doesn't appear  
5 to have moved and it's a D. So help me understand  
6 how on one hand I want to say way to go; on the other  
7 hand I want to say but I'm not seeing that in kind of  
8 the letter grade metric. And so I don't want to give  
9 too much credit to their movement and their progress;  
10 at the same time I do feel like there's some  
11 accountability that needs to be held there. And so  
12 we don't want to misrepresent, you know, the overall  
13 outcome. So can you talk through that for a little  
14 bit for me? And it could be a timing issue.

15 MS. GRAYER: The purpose of the Schools on the  
16 Move report is not to necessarily highlight a letter  
17 grade, because the ESSA School Index is so much more  
18 complex than just a letter grade. And so the purpose  
19 of the report is to highlight movement -- did they  
20 make progress from year to year -- and so we pick out  
21 very specific points of interest. So 5 points or  
22 more on the overall ESSA School Index, you get  
23 recognized; 10 points or more in weighted  
24 achievement, you get a recognition; two standard  
25 deviations or more above the mean in growth, you get

1 a recognition; one letter grade or more, you get a  
2 recognition. So there is very specific criteria in  
3 our Standard Operating Procedure for Schools on the  
4 Move, and so it's not all about a letter grade, just  
5 like ESSA School Index is not all about a letter  
6 grade. Your accountability system is about so much  
7 more.

8 MR. DAVIS: And I understand that, and I'll stop  
9 after this comment. But I hope you can see kind of  
10 how this can create some confusion in the general  
11 public. Right? This idea of sort of saying, hey,  
12 look at the great sort of letter on the move  
13 recognition we've gotten, but then when the public  
14 sort of looks at -- and so I'm just trying to figure  
15 out how to -- how we can ground that, land that, do  
16 that in a way that's instructive and helpful to  
17 parents as they just sort of get these sort of  
18 recognitions and/or, you know, look to letter grades  
19 to kind of indicate quality. So --

20 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: Mr. Davis, let me add that if  
21 you're looking at the sheets that we have for the  
22 next items, you'll see that there was no letter grade  
23 in 2021. As you know, we had two years that were  
24 waived by our legislators. So what you don't see  
25 then is the ESSA Index score for that year. And so

1 making progress -- so the index scores, the  
2 celebration of those is from last year to this year.  
3 And the letter grades are from way back in 2019 to  
4 2022, which is quite a gap but important to note.  
5 And the purpose of Schools on the Move from the very  
6 beginning when we started creating this -- and it  
7 does make a lot more sense when the years are backed  
8 up to each other and you don't have these big gaps in  
9 time. But the purpose was to really encourage  
10 schools to keep working hard when -- and to celebrate  
11 every little step in progress that you're making  
12 because our kids really do deserve that. And  
13 sometimes the adults just need to be motivated to  
14 keep on going and to know that people are recognizing  
15 and they are looking and they want the very best for  
16 their students.

17 MR. DAVIS: Yeah, I appreciate that. I'm --  
18 I'll stop there. I think there's something to be  
19 said about our role as a charter authorizing body and  
20 what that looks like, what Schools on the Move was  
21 designed to do for the public, not necessarily for  
22 the Charter Authorizing Committee. The presentation  
23 that we have now, letter grades -- as you sort of  
24 indicated, with the gap here like there's a lot,  
25 obviously, that's happened over the last three to

1 four years that I want to make sure we sort of ground  
2 in a way that helps us think about how to move the  
3 work forward. But I do agree that we need to applaud  
4 those institutions that are making -- even if they  
5 are incremental steps. I'm just not sure if there is  
6 some real clarity around, you know, what that then  
7 means for the overall quality of the institution.  
8 But thank you for giving me the time.

9 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: Mr. Baldwin.

10 MR. BALDWIN: I appreciate the comments. And I  
11 also appreciate how hard it is to accumulate data, as  
12 an accountant, and I like the quantifiable  
13 information that you presented. And I know there's  
14 nuances to anything with numbers. But this is  
15 helpful and it gives us a basis to have a discussion.  
16 So, thank you.

17 MS. GRAYER: Thank you very much. And I do  
18 appreciate the feedback. We can always strive to  
19 improve to do better, so --

20 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: All right. Thank you, Ms.  
21 Grayer.

22 MS. GRAYER: I appreciate it. Thank you for  
23 having me here today.

24 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: And if you'll stick around in  
25 case we have more questions?

1 MS. GRAYER: Absolutely.

2 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: All right.

3 MS. GRAYER: Thank you all.

4 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: Ms. Summons, in our review of  
5 charters you've got two documents for us. You want  
6 to come up and kind of present what you've provided  
7 to us?

8 MS. SUMMONS: Good morning. You will have two  
9 documents. The first one is the data for the open  
10 enrollment campuses. On these charts you'll see the  
11 name of the charters, you'll see the enrollment caps,  
12 the data -- the authorizing date, the dates that they  
13 expire, and each one of the campuses is listed. For  
14 some schools we have an enrollment cap per campus,  
15 and some schools we do not. As we start bringing  
16 them in for renewals, we're going to start asking  
17 them for an enrollment per campus so we can kind of  
18 keep up with that information. You'll also see the  
19 grade levels, the enrollment for the third quarter,  
20 their school letter grades from 18-19, 19-20. In 20-  
21 21, there were no grades. And then 21-22. Students  
22 in need of support and then the '21 graduation rate,  
23 the four-year graduation rate. And this information  
24 is for both open enrollment and district conversions.

25 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: So what we hope today is to

1 give you a chance to look at that and kind of  
2 question some of the I-wonders. One thing that I  
3 will note for you, if you look at your open  
4 enrollment charter school data sheet you'll notice  
5 that eStem Public Charter will come before us in  
6 December for renewal; so you might want to mark them  
7 on there. Friendship Aspire Academies of Arkansas  
8 will come for renewal, and KIPP Delta, Premier High  
9 Schools of Arkansas, and ScholarMade. Those five  
10 open enrollment will be up for renewal in December,  
11 so we will see them. Hopefully this data will help  
12 you to think about some of the questions that you'll  
13 want to talk to them about, and then, of course, all  
14 of their ESSA School Index information is available  
15 on My School Info just by going to My School Info and  
16 typing in their name. You can pull that up.

17 So if you'd like to start with open enrollment  
18 charters, we'll just be open for discussion. What  
19 future data would you like to hear from the charter  
20 school? What would you like for the Charter Office  
21 to investigate? Potential groups that if we can get  
22 out and talk to those charters and bring a report  
23 that maybe then you might want to consider whether or  
24 not you want to bring them in in the spring?

25 Mr. Baldwin?

1           MR. BALDWIN: One that really stood out to me  
2 and I guess what I was looking at primarily was the  
3 -- was any decrease in grades, any downward movement.  
4 And it looks like the -- like Jacksonville Lighthouse  
5 Academy schools, who I've always seen to be a pretty  
6 solid program in the past with letter grades, it  
7 looks like their letter grades have fallen down to  
8 many in the D and F range. And I just wondered what  
9 caused that and is there something that we can do to  
10 help. So really just those questions, but it was the  
11 movement of grades on this school that attracted my  
12 attention.

13           CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: Okay. That's a great  
14 question. We'll submit that to them and get  
15 something in writing, and then you can look at it as  
16 a panel and decide if you need further information.

17           Any others?

18           DR. WRIGHT-McMURRAY: I guess I will say,  
19 similar to Mr. Baldwin, that I thought it was  
20 (inaudible, not speaking into mic) -- and more so for  
21 me when it went into the D and F category. Because  
22 again, you know, we want to provide grace to schools  
23 that maybe fell to a C and whatnot because of, you  
24 know, we'll say Covid. But that kind of challenged  
25 me. But when we -- if we're already at a D and then

1 fell to the F, or we're at a D and stayed at a D, I  
2 kind of -- those were the ones that kind of jumped  
3 out at me. But what -- I was kind of looking at a  
4 pattern; I tried to -- you know, all of our -- some  
5 of our virtual schools are struggling mightily. And  
6 so I'm just kind of wanting to get a sense of what's  
7 causing that for them, have they been able to rebound  
8 since we've, you know, started to come out of Covid  
9 and restrictions have been lifted, people are pretty  
10 much fully back engaging. Is it that, that maybe  
11 their students -- I think you mentioned we're not  
12 returning at the rate that they should have or just  
13 weren't engaging. What is that? Because there's  
14 been -- this is the pattern that we want to look at,  
15 all those that are deemed online or virtual --  
16 they're in that D or F range. And to me, that's  
17 concerning.

18 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: Okay. Good questions.

19 MR. BALDWIN: I just thought of something too.  
20 I thought Mr. Davis's point was really good about  
21 comparing the charter school average to the  
22 traditional school average, and see how we're doing  
23 as a charter program. Because, in theory, the  
24 charter should be doing something a little bit  
25 different and better than the traditional schools,

1 which is how they exist. But it would be interesting  
2 to have that macro comparison, but then also to see  
3 the charter schools that may be under the average for  
4 the traditional schools in their area, and that would  
5 be good to know.

6 MS. NEWTON: One thing I was thinking about as  
7 it relates to charters or just general ed., all the  
8 schools acknowledging the learning loss and what we  
9 lost during the pandemic. Is there any plan to try  
10 to recover -- you know, not extra homework,  
11 naturally. But is there a thought then given to  
12 bringing the students up to where -- if they're in  
13 10th grade now and they're not scoring as they  
14 should, where do we anticipate they will be in 12th  
15 grade? Will they still be behind or is that  
16 something that's a conscious thought or is that  
17 something just that will be left up to the student  
18 and the parents or whatever? But if you're expected  
19 to know A, B and C by the time you graduate, will our  
20 students be there?

21 (BRIEF MOMENT OF SILENCE)

22 MS. NEWTON: I knew it was a dumb question. Now  
23 I'm not an educator.

24 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: Well, I'm trying to make sure  
25 I get that written down correctly. So you're wanting

1 to know how the schools are addressing learning loss,  
2 what -- how are they accelerating the learners?

3 MS. NEWTON: Right. Right. Right. That's what  
4 -- because everyone acknowledges nationwide that --  
5 what has happened based on what we've all gone  
6 through. So how is that -- so, you know, the  
7 graduation rate might change or whatever might  
8 change. But I'm just wondering if particular  
9 attention is being given to bringing --  
10 acknowledging, first of all, that some learning loss  
11 has occurred, but having an opportunity to recover  
12 that. Is there any -- again, I'm not an educator, so  
13 I don't know about how that's done. But it seems  
14 like -- or do we accept that you're going to be like  
15 a semester behind when you graduate as opposed to  
16 going into taking your ACT with the skills you need,  
17 but acknowledging that you're going to be minus a  
18 couple of points just based on what the nation has  
19 gone through.

20 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: Okay. Great question.

21 MS. SARACINI: It is a great question. And,  
22 Chair, I would like to say maybe even take it a step  
23 further to see what they've put in place and how  
24 they've utilized their ESSER dollars on addressing  
25 the learning loss, because I think that would maybe

1 be another comparison as we go forward looking at  
2 this. Because I think not just the grades but also  
3 attendance, we need to compare and look at that as  
4 well -- what's the attendance rate with the charters  
5 compared with traditional. I think that's another  
6 point too, as I just kind of am looking and thinking  
7 through my mind what I would like to see. I think we  
8 have to see the whole picture because I think you've  
9 got to understand maybe the root cause of where we  
10 can really do an analysis of what's going on and get  
11 the whole picture. Is that possible?

12 MS. NEWTON: And I think -- I'm sorry. And I  
13 think especially as it relates to testing, getting  
14 ready to go into ACT or prepping for ACT and looking  
15 at the impact. So if your scores are down, then what  
16 -- you know, what avenue or what -- assuming that  
17 everybody is still on the measure nationwide and  
18 everybody has been through the same thing, what then  
19 does it mean to have a 23? Is a 19 now what a 23  
20 was? I don't know. It's just -- it's a question,  
21 just a layman's question.

22 CHAIRMAN NEWTON: So, I'm sorry, Ms. Newton.  
23 Say that last sentence again, the last question  
24 again.

25 MS. NEWTON: Well, the last sentence is to be

1 able to look at the variance and where the percentage  
2 of gain or loss is and look at testing to determine  
3 what is expected. Say, well, we expected, based on  
4 the situation, that our ACTs would be down 12%. Or  
5 the end-year or Aspire or whatever. Is there any  
6 balance or any mechanism to determine this is -- you  
7 know, yes, it's low; but given the circumstances, is  
8 this within average of how schools are doing  
9 basically? Basically, schools are losing so many  
10 basis points or -- I knew it didn't make sense. It  
11 just -- I've got a question but I can't get it out, I  
12 don't think, the way --

13 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: So I think what I'm hearing  
14 you say -- and correct me if I'm wrong -- I think  
15 what you're saying is if we go back in and look at  
16 the analysis on each of these schools are the schools  
17 falling around the average, above the average, or way  
18 below the average. We only give a state average; we  
19 don't give a charter average.

20 MS. NEWTON: No. And it's not necessarily a  
21 charter. But, you know, since we're talking about  
22 charters -- but just to know that, you know, it looks  
23 bad but it's not really as bad as it looks because --  
24 based on the fact that this is the average, you know,  
25 decline or increase during this period. And the same

1 thing is true for those schools that are doing so  
2 much better, for whatever reason. And we can say,  
3 you know, this is exemplary or extraordinary that  
4 this is happening, because based on what we've been  
5 through this is the average of loss or this is the  
6 average of decline in test scores. And that may or  
7 may not be something you guys measure, but I was just  
8 wondering. Because given -- like I say, given the  
9 circumstances, there's an expectation that there has  
10 been decline. And, you know, my question revolves  
11 around the fact of given that expectation are there  
12 -- there's no efforts being made to regain lost  
13 ground.

14 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: So, in general, I would say  
15 that's certainly what we would expect the schools to  
16 be looking at; they would be looking at this data  
17 that just went public last Thursday morning or last  
18 Wednesday and having those conversations with their  
19 community and updating their School Improvement  
20 Plans, their district support plans. But I think  
21 we'll go back and look at that and see how we might  
22 put together an analysis for the Charter Panel that  
23 might help have a way to look at that as well.

24 MS. NEWTON: Thank you.

25 DR. WRIGHT-McMURRAY: And I know that -- I'm

1           sorry.

2           CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: Ms. Wright-McMurray.

3           DR. WRIGHT-McMURRAY: I know that I mentioned it  
4 earlier when we were listening to the presentation.  
5 But going back to Academics Plus, with Scott  
6 Elementary School, I'd like to get a little bit more  
7 information on --

8           CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: On Scott?

9           DR. WRIGHT-McMURRAY: -- on the classroom there.  
10 And I'm trying to figure it out in my head, and I  
11 think it's been mentioned a couple of times, what --  
12 so if we're looking at Scott Elementary, what would  
13 be their comparable school? So if we wanted to say  
14 -- and this is just what I was thinking through in my  
15 head -- is that -- you know, if Scott Elementary  
16 would be comparable to this elementary and how are  
17 they doing against their peers that would be within  
18 their compilation of students, a certain demographic,  
19 and then size. I may be asking for something that's  
20 way more than what -- but those are just some things  
21 I just -- I often wonder about when we're looking at  
22 the charter school and their outcomes comparable to a  
23 school that's not a charter school, how -- are they  
24 doing much better than their peers that is serving  
25 some of the students in similar demographics.

1           CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: So you're looking in the same  
2 region of -- like their neighboring schools?

3           DR. WRIGHT-McMURRAY: That would be -- because I  
4 want to be fair to the schools where they're serving,  
5 you know, similar enrollments and demographic of  
6 students; are we seeing -- what are their outcomes  
7 compared to their peer outcomes.

8           CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: So --

9           DR. WRIGHT-McMURRAY: And I don't know if that's  
10 something that we -- and that may be something I'm  
11 just thinking through in my head, but it is something  
12 -- but if I'm looking even within their district,  
13 they have Maumelle Charter Elementary -- they have an  
14 A. But then within that same they have a D. So are  
15 they doing the same things for these kids here that  
16 they're doing over here? Are they using the same  
17 resources that they need to to make sure that this  
18 school has an A, to make sure this school moves off  
19 of that D. They were at a D in 18-19, and they're at  
20 a D again in 21-22.

21           CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: So --

22           DR. WRIGHT-McMURRAY: And I don't know if the  
23 grade -- I don't know if that grade is a typo. It  
24 says K-10 for the grade range.

25           CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: Is that correct, Mr.

1 Sutherlin? The grade range for Scott Elementary, K-  
2 10?

3 DR. SUTHERLIN: That's what I'm looking up.

4 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: Okay. If you'll look that up  
5 and let's just make sure.

6 So let's kind of talk a little bit about this  
7 idea of comparability.

8 DR. WRIGHT-McMURRAY: That helps me out, so that  
9 I kind of know.

10 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: Yeah. So I think that's  
11 going to be a question that -- especially coming up  
12 with the schools that are coming up for renewal. I  
13 mean, we have to put together a lot of data to bring  
14 to you but -- so we can start with the schools that  
15 are coming up for renewal in December and look at who  
16 are the comparable schools. And in their original  
17 application they usually tell us, hey, I'm going to  
18 be pulling kids from these communities. So you would  
19 expect that those schools would be the comparable  
20 schools. Is that -- would you agree? Is that who  
21 you're thinking are comparable schools?

22 DR. WRIGHT-McMURRAY: I think that helps me to  
23 better understand.

24 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: The community?

25 DR. WRIGHT-McMURRAY: Yes. Because, you know, I

1 don't want to compare this school to that school if  
2 they're not like a certain -- same type of students,  
3 their demographics are different, if -- you know, if  
4 they're starting at different places, I don't want to  
5 say, okay, well, this school has an A, so you should  
6 have an A also immediately. Now we -- our hope is  
7 that we get you to those steps, but not immediately;  
8 we know you have to work to get there. So it's hard  
9 for me to kind of sense what's happening with that  
10 school because they're in the same area. Well --

11 (BRIEF PAUSE)

12 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: No?

13 DR. WRIGHT-McMURRAY: Well, I'd want to know if  
14 they're in the same district who are they serving  
15 versus who is that school serving.

16 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: Okay.

17 MR. DAVIS: Yeah. Because sometimes, Dr.  
18 Wright-McMurray, I think -- I think you're bringing  
19 up a very nuanced point. And, Ms. Coffman, you --  
20 obviously you know this better than all of us here.  
21 But this idea of geography doesn't always equate to  
22 the same type of students served. Right? So if you  
23 were to take Hope Academy, right, in the Bentonville  
24 area that really focuses on kids who have dealt with  
25 a tremendous amount of trauma, they are serving a

1 specific demographic of students that does not look  
2 like the Bentonville School District; and therefore,  
3 you know, the geography -- we can't just say, right,  
4 the geography is this.

5 And part of the work around charters -- and Ms.  
6 Newton sort of alluded to this -- is one to be, one,  
7 this testing ground and then, two, to have a very  
8 clear vision and mission. And so sometimes that  
9 vision and mission may not be comparable to what you  
10 might find. And so, for example, if we go to the  
11 other end of the spectrum I think you have an  
12 institution, like Haas Hall Academy, that's purely  
13 focused on, as much as they can be -- they're very  
14 candid about college acceptance rate. Right? So  
15 they're not going to have as strong a career focused  
16 education dynamic that you might find at the  
17 Springdale School District that's looking to really  
18 serve, you know, kids who are interested in pursuing  
19 a specific career, a workforce kind of opportunity,  
20 versus a higher education opportunity. Right? It's  
21 going to draw different people based upon what the  
22 mission and vision of that school is, although it's  
23 in the same geography. And that's where it gets  
24 really complicated to kind of do the, hey, well,  
25 what's the school up the road doing; is it doing

1 better than the school up the road or worse than the  
2 school up the road, quote/unquote, better or worse.  
3 Because it really is going to be dependent -- and I  
4 think you're trying to bring this out, Dr. Wright-  
5 McMurray -- but please tell me if I'm incorrect -- it  
6 really is going to be dependent upon the type of  
7 student that the school has decided to serve and  
8 focus on. As you've admitted -- the last thing I'll  
9 say, and I wholeheartedly agree with you -- when you  
10 look at an institution like Hope Academy and the  
11 students they're serving, right, it's to me a very  
12 necessary, needed -- and I think they're doing an  
13 outstanding job with the students that they're  
14 serving. If you were to look at the report, which I  
15 actually like the report a lot -- but if you were to  
16 look at the report, you know, you start looking at  
17 students in need of services, their letter grades,  
18 it's not the best. So all of those things have to be  
19 taken in consideration as we sort of have this  
20 conversation.

21 DR. WRIGHT-McMURRAY: What he said. I'll say  
22 what he said.

23 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: Oh, what he said. Yes, Dr.  
24 -- Mr. Davis, that's exactly --

25 DR. WRIGHT-McMURRAY: That's what I was trying

1 to get to is that I'm seeing two D's, but why am I  
2 seeing the two D's? And then the other piece of it  
3 is because we're in Academics Plus district what are  
4 they doing at the A school versus the D school, and  
5 are they trying to just go, okay, well, this works at  
6 the A school, but is that working at the D school.  
7 And what are -- you may feel like that what you're  
8 doing for your A school students is effective, but if  
9 that's not what the D school students will respond to  
10 or need, is that being effective? So just those  
11 pieces.

12 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: Okay. Well, some of these --  
13 some of this will require us to do interviews with  
14 some of the schools. So we'll bring those back to  
15 you as quickly as we can --

16 DR. WRIGHT-McMURRAY: Right.

17 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: -- get them. And that's all  
18 right, that's what we do. But I think it's really a  
19 great conversation to be thinking about, and I think  
20 Mr. Davis brought up one of our schools that -- I  
21 mean, I just couldn't be prouder to be associated  
22 with, to know that there are schools like Hope  
23 Academy. We went to visit recently and just the work  
24 they're doing is truly, truly amazing, and so happy  
25 that people wanted to take that on. In fact, this

1 morning in our leadership meeting we were pulling out  
2 the A-to-F rules and looking to see why the -- why do  
3 we have to give a letter grade to that school, and I  
4 think it's a point of conversation that we need to  
5 have moving forward. And I'll just read to you the  
6 section that does eliminate some of our charter  
7 schools from letter grades, like Graduate Arkansas,  
8 Premier. For purpose of these rules only, the  
9 following entities shall be exempt from the  
10 designation of a school rating: an open enrollment  
11 public charter, or conversion public charter, whose  
12 mission and enrollment are primarily focused on  
13 students who have dropped out of high school or are  
14 identified as at-risk of dropping out of school.

15 So Hope Academy does not meet that definition,  
16 but there may be an opportunity to think about future  
17 rules to say do we need to add something that does  
18 address these types of schools that are meeting the  
19 needs of kids but a letter grade may not accurately  
20 represent the value that they're bringing to our  
21 students.

22 So I think that's something -- Ms. Wagner, put  
23 that on your list -- that I think we'll want to talk  
24 about and consider when it comes time to revise the  
25 rules.

1 DR. WRIGHT-McMURRAY: And so, I'm glad you  
2 brought that point up because I did put a question  
3 mark by Graduate Arkansas, because they have an F.  
4 And so I was just trying to get a sense -- because by  
5 what you just read that makes sense to me. If we're  
6 working with students that traditionally are going to  
7 need a little bit more support and scaffolding to be  
8 able to be successful, is that really an F.

9 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: So, actually, when the  
10 document was revised that F was replaced with an N/A  
11 --

12 DR. WRIGHT-McMURRAY: Okay.

13 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: -- because it does not apply  
14 to them.

15 DR. WRIGHT-McMURRAY: Okay.

16 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: So, but I think the point is  
17 exactly that. That's why that's in the rule to not  
18 assign letter grades to some of our specialty  
19 schools.

20 DR. WRIGHT-McMURRAY: I think I may have printed  
21 this before.

22 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: Sure. Sure.

23 So, I mean, I think those bring the conversation  
24 back to what Mr. Davis was saying is it's about the  
25 mission. Most of this is about the mission of the

1 charter, and so that's something that I think we have  
2 to be very intentional, as Charter Panel members,  
3 when we're reviewing charters, new charters or  
4 renewals, that we have a really accurate  
5 understanding of the mission of the school, because  
6 everything really unfolds from there.

7 Any other questions about open enrollment  
8 charters?

9 Let me ask the Panel, would it be helpful to you  
10 as we're going forward if we come back with the --  
11 we'll come back -- after working on some of these  
12 questions that maybe we come back with some quick  
13 links to the ESSA School Index for all of these  
14 schools?

15 (COURT REPORTER'S NOTE: Panel Members responded  
16 affirmatively.)

17 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: Okay. We can start working  
18 on that, Ms. Summons, and go ahead and send that out  
19 to our Panel Members by email so that they'll have  
20 those, just a quick sheet. And then we'll put it on  
21 our probably January agenda to come back and review  
22 and see if there are additional questions and bring  
23 our additional data.

24 2) REVIEW OF DISTRICT CONVERSION CHARTER SCHOOLS

25 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: As you looked at the district

1 conversion sheet, anything that stood out to you?  
2 Just a reminder that we have three on here that would  
3 be up for renewal -- Bauxite Miner Academy, Polk  
4 County Virtual Online in Mena, and Rogers New  
5 Technology. And we have received word from Rogers  
6 New Technology that they are going to go the school  
7 of innovation route, so they will not be coming  
8 before us for renewal. They will be, I'm assuming,  
9 giving up their charter if they are -- they're giving  
10 up their charter status to move to school of  
11 innovation.

12 DR. WRIGHT-McMURRAY: You said Bauxite Miner  
13 Academy. Then what was the next one?

14 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: Bauxite Miner Academy, Polk  
15 County Virtual Academy are the two that will be  
16 coming before us in December for renewal.

17 MS. SARACINI: Polk and Bauxite?

18 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: Uh-huh.

19 MS. SARACINI: Do you suggest that we go for a  
20 visit?

21 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: Oh, yes. Ms. Saracini asked  
22 about visiting for renewals. And I would say yes. I  
23 would highly encourage you to make a visit. Let Ms.  
24 Summons know when you're going to be visiting so she  
25 can document that. I've already been to eStem. And

1 we've been out visiting the Premiers; we haven't been  
2 to all of them yet, but we've been out visiting  
3 those. I went to ScholarMade last year. So I'm  
4 looking forward to KIPP and Friendship very soon,  
5 having conversation with them and getting that  
6 planned out. And I've been thinking about doing some  
7 of -- the two district conversions virtually since  
8 they're virtual schools. So I think that's another  
9 opportunity to think about how you might be getting  
10 to them in a timely manner.

11 MS. SARACINI: So it's KIPP, Friendship -- so  
12 repeat the --

13 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: Up for renewal?

14 MS. SARACINI: Open -- uh-huh.

15 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: KIPP, eStem, Friendship  
16 Aspire, Premier High School of Arkansas (which is  
17 Little Rock, Texarkana, Fort Smith, and the virtual  
18 academy), ScholarMade, Bauxite Miner Academy, and  
19 Polk County Virtual.

20 MS. SARACINI: Thank you.

21 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: Mr. Davis, anything that you  
22 noticed about the district conversion?

23 MR. DAVIS: No, nothing from me.

24 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: Ms. Wagner, I see you coming  
25 to give us advice.

1 MS. WAGNER: Hi. I'm Ms. Wagner with DESE  
2 Legal.

3 I just wanted to remind everybody that if you do  
4 go for a visit, if more than one of you goes out to  
5 each school to be sure to notify Ms. Summons so she  
6 can send a FOIA notice. Because that would be  
7 considered a meeting under FOIA and we want to be as  
8 open and transparent as possible. So, that's all.

9 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: Thank you.

10 Ms. Newton, any other questions or thoughts?

11 (BRIEF MOMENT OF SILENCE)

12 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: Ms. Newton, any other  
13 questions or thoughts?

14 MS. NEWTON: I'm sorry; I was muted. No, thank  
15 you, I don't have any questions.

16 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: Thank you.

17 Mr. Baldwin?

18 MR. BALDWIN: No.

19 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: Ms. Saracini?

20 MS. SARACINI: None.

21 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: Ms. Wright-McMurray?

22 DR. WRIGHT-McMURRAY: Just the similar comment  
23 that I made when we were looking at the other  
24 charters. It's just the online charters seem to all  
25 either have D's or F's, and so I just want to get a

1 little bit more information about what's happening  
2 with those.

3 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: Okay. All right.

4 Ms. Wagner, if you'll come back. This is on our  
5 action item to discuss. Do we need to make a motion  
6 or accept these reports or anything like that?

7 MS. WAGNER: I don't believe you need to make a  
8 motion to accept the reports because you're bringing  
9 back more information, unless you do want to go ahead  
10 and accept the reports now. But you are getting more  
11 information on them. So if you want to wait until  
12 the January meeting to go ahead and accept the  
13 reports, I think that's fine as well.

14 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: Okay.

15 MS. WAGNER: It's however the Panel decides it  
16 wants to do it.

17 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: Panel, would you like to  
18 accept these reports now or come back in January with  
19 additional information?

20 DR. WRIGHT-McMURRAY: I do have a question.

21 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: Okay, Ms. Wright-McMurray.

22 DR. WRIGHT-McMURRAY: Sorry.

23 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: Is your microphone on?

24 DR. WRIGHT-McMURRAY: I think it is.

25 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: Okay.

1 DR. WRIGHT-McMURRAY: Yeah. So then once we get  
2 the reports back, then that's when we'll be able to  
3 talk as a panel and determine those we want to come  
4 in person and then give further explanation beyond  
5 that?

6 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: Yes.

7 DR. WRIGHT-McMURRAY: So there's more movement  
8 beyond getting the reports back?

9 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: Yes.

10 DR. WRIGHT-McMURRAY: Okay.

11 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: Yes. We'll -- so usually in  
12 the January, February, March time is the time when,  
13 you know, we're reviewing charters, bringing them  
14 back in, bringing in more data, having conversations  
15 like that. We try not to, you know, have 25 of them  
16 on one day.

17 DR. WRIGHT-McMURRAY: No.

18 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: But to really get to the root  
19 of the issues and see what type of support needs to  
20 be put in place.

21 DR. WRIGHT-McMURRAY: Okay.

22 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: And maybe we can -- the  
23 office can kind of group some that are similar to  
24 come together.

25 DR. WRIGHT-McMURRAY: Okay.

1 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: Does that sound good?

2 DR. WRIGHT-McMURRAY: Yes.

3 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: All right. So is the  
4 consensus that we will delay the final approval of  
5 the reports till the spring, after we've heard the  
6 additional information?

7 Yes. I'm hearing -- seeing head-nods and  
8 thumbs. All right. Good deal. Then that's what we  
9 will do. We'll --

10 MS. SARACINI: Do we need to make a motion?

11 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: Nah.

12 MS. SARACINI: Okay.

13 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: We'll bring all that back to  
14 you.

15 NEW BUSINESS

16 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: Any other business? Ms.  
17 Wagner, any other business?

18 MS. WAGNER: No.

19 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: Ms. Summons, any other  
20 business?

21 MS. SUMMONS: We have received all of our  
22 renewal applications. The dates for the renewals  
23 will be December 13th and 14th. So we are looking  
24 for you to be with us in person, if you can. And  
25 those will be all-day meetings.

1 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: December 13th and 14th.

2 And I did fail to mention at the beginning that  
3 we received a letter of resignation from Mr. Mark  
4 Zellner --

5 MS. SUMMONS: Yes.

6 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: -- for our Charter Panel. I  
7 think, Ms. Summons, he'd taken a new job or something  
8 that wouldn't allow him to have time to meet with us?

9 MS. SUMMONS: Yes, ma'am. He's got other job  
10 duties and responsibilities, and so he sent us a  
11 letter of resignation.

12 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: He did such a great job. We  
13 were blessed to have him on here for the amount of  
14 time that he was with us.

15 Any other thoughts, questions or comments?

16 ADJOURNMENT

17 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: Then, I'll accept a motion to  
18 adjourn.

19 MS. SARACINI: I make a motion to adjourn.

20 DR. WRIGHT-McMURRAY: Second.

21 CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: I have a motion from Ms.  
22 Saracini and a second from Ms. Wright-McMurray to  
23 adjourn the meeting.

24 All those in favor?

25 (AYES FROM ALL BUT MR. DAVIS)

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: Meeting --

MR. DAVIS: Aye.

CHAIRMAN COFFMAN: Thank you everyone. Motion passes. The meeting is adjourned.

(The meeting was concluded at 10:14 a.m.)

## C E R T I F I C A T E

STATE OF ARKANSAS    )  
                                   ) ss.  
 COUNTY OF SALINE     )

I, SHARON K. HILL, CCR, a Certified Stenomask Reporter and Notary Public before whom the foregoing proceedings was taken, do hereby certify that the same is a true and correct transcription before the Arkansas Division of Elementary and Secondary Education, Charter Authorizing Panel, in Little Rock, Arkansas, on November 15, 2022; that the said proceedings was reduced to typewritten form by me or under my direction and supervision; and that the foregoing pages constitute a true and correct transcription of all proceedings had in said matter.

I FURTHER CERTIFY that I am neither counsel for, related to, nor employed by any of the parties to this action.

I FURTHER CERTIFY that I have no contract with any parties within this action that affects or has a substantial tendency to affect impartiality, that requires me to relinquish control of an original transcript or copies of the transcript before it is certified and delivered to the custodial agency, or that requires me to provide any service not made available to all parties to the action.

WITNESS, MY HAND AND SEAL, THIS DATE: November 22, 2022.

---

SHARON K. HILL, CCR  
 Certified Court Reporter  
 Certificate No. 670